Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Traditional Common Law Immunity and the Origins of Texas Dram Shop Liability ........................................1
  1-1 TRADITIONAL IMMUNITY ................................................1
  1-2 EL CHICO V. POOLE ............................................................2
  1-3 THE STATUTE .................................................................4
  1-4 COMMON LAW OR STATUTORY CAUSE OF ACTION .................6
  1-5 COMMENTARY ...............................................................7

Chapter 2: The Statutory Cause of Action Section 2.02 Texas Alcoholic Beverage Code .................................................9
  2-1 “PROVIDER” DEFINED .....................................................9
  2-2 SECTION 2.02(A) ............................................................10
  2-3 SECTION 2.02(B) ............................................................10
  2-4 THE MEANING OF “OBVIOUS INTOXICATION” AND “AT THE TIME THE PROVISION OCCURRED.” ..........17

Chapter 3: Traditional Common Law Social Host Immunity ............. 23
  3-1 TRADITIONAL IMMUNITY ...............................................23
  3-2 COMMON LAW SOCIAL HOST IMMUNITY AFTER 1987 AND BEFORE 2005 ........................................23
  3-3 THE ESTABLISHMENT OF CIVIL LIABILITY FOR CERTAIN SOCIAL HOSTS ........................................25

Chapter 4: Statutory Social Host Liability, Texas Alcoholic Beverage Code Section 2.02c .................. 27
  4-1 THE STATUTE ...............................................................27
  4-2 THE EFFECTIVE DATE ....................................................28
  4-3 THE PRACTICAL APPLICATION OF THE STATUTE ..................28
Table of Contents

Chapter 5: The Exclusivity of the Cause of Action, Texas Alcoholic Beverage Code Section 2.03 .................. 31
5-1 THE STATUTE ................................................................. 31
5-2 ATTEMPTS TO CIRCUMVENT THE EXCLUSIVITY ...... 32
5-3 THE PRACTICAL EFFECT OF THE EXCLUSIVE REMEDY PROVISION .................................. 33

Chapter 6: The Recovery of Exemplary Damages .................. 39
6-1 STEAK & ALE OF TEXAS, INC. V. BORNEMAN ............ 39
6-2 TEXAS CIVIL PRACTICE AND REMEDIES CODE 41.005 AND WILSON V. KWG .................... 40
6-3 WRONGFUL DEATH AND THE TEXAS CONSTITUTION .......................................................... 43

Chapter 7: The Safe Harbor Affirmative Defense, Texas Alcoholic Beverage Code Section 106.14 .................. 49
7-1 THE STATUTE ................................................................. 49
7-2 THE FIRST PRONG AND THE EVIDENCE ...................... 50
7-3 THE SECOND PRONG AND THE EVIDENCE .................. 52
7-4 THE THIRD PRONG AND THE EVIDENCE BEFORE PARKER .................................................. 54
7-5 20801 V. PARKER ........................................................... 58
7-6 COMMENTARY—PARKER SHIFTS THE BURDEN OF PROOF AND STANDS TRADITIONAL NOTIONS OF AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES ON THEIR HEAD ........................................ 60
7-7 USING THE TEXAS ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGE CODE RULES TO DEFEAT THE SAFE HARBOR DEFENSE ..... 63
7-8 DEFEATING THE SAFE HARBOR DEFENSE BY SUING THE INDIVIDUAL SERVER IN ADDITION TO THE LICENSED ESTABLISHMENT .......................................................... 65

Chapter 8: Duenez and the Proportionate Responsibility Act: Application to Dram Shop Cases .................. 69
8-1 BACKGROUND OF THE DUENEZ CASE ...................... 69
8-2 THE COURT’S PRETRIAL RULING ................................. 70
8-3 THE TRIAL RESULT .......................................................... 71
8-4 THE COURT OF APPEALS AFFIRMS ............................. 72
8-5 THE SUPREME COURT ISSUES THREE OPINIONS ...... 73
8-6 THE PRACTICAL EFFECT OF THE ULTIMATE HOLDING AND THE COMPARATIVE RESPONSIBILITY ACT ................................................................................. 74
Table of Contents

8-7 COMMENTARY .................................................. 74
8-8 THE DRUNK DRIVER DEFENDANT AS A RESPONSIBLE THIRD PARTY …………... 75

Chapter 9: Evaluating the Potential Dram Shop Case
  From the Plaintiff’s Perspective ................................................. 79
  9-1 THIRD PARTY CASES ........................................... 79
  9-2 FIRST PARTY CASES ............................................. 81
  9-3 SECOND PARTY CASES ............................................ 83

Chapter 10: Pre-Litigation Investigation and Preparation ………….. 85
  10-1 WITNESS STATEMENTS AND EXAMINATION UNDER OATH: EYEWITNESSES AND SERVERS .............. 85
  10-2 CONTACT WITH THE DRUNK DRIVER’S CRIMINAL DEFENSE LAWYER: NON-DISCOVERABLE WITNESS INTERVIEW .......... 90
  10-3 ONSITE INVESTIGATION AND THWARTING THE SAFE HARBOR DEFENSE PRE-LITIGATION ....... 91
  10-4 POLICE REPORT AND BLOOD ALCOHOL CONCENTRATION ............................................ 92
  10-5 FILING SUIT AGAINST THE DRUNK DRIVER IN THE CASE OF A SECOND PARTY OR THIRD PARTY ACTION PRIOR TO SUING THE ESTABLISHMENT ...... 93
  10-6 PRE-LITIGATION INVESTIGATION ON BEHALF OF THE ESTABLISHMENT ................................ 94
  10-7 AVOIDING THE MISTAKES MOST OFTEN MADE BY PLAINTIFF’S ATTORNEYS ........................................... 95

Chapter 11: Preparation of Plaintiff’s Original Petition and Strategic Considerations From the Plaintiff’s Perspective .......... 101
  11-1 PARTIES TO BE NAMED IN THE PETITION AND WHY .............................................. 101
  11-2 REQUEST FOR DISCLOSURE ........................................ 103
  11-3 REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION .................................... 106
  11-4 INTERROGATORIES ................................................. 109
  11-5 STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS FROM THE PLAINTIFF’S PERSPECTIVE ................................. 113

Chapter 12: The Filing of a Contemporaneous Complaint
  With the Texas Alcoholic Beverage Code ................................. 119
  12-1 INTRODUCTION .................................................. 119
  12-2 COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL CONSIDERATIONS .............. 121
## Table of Contents

### Chapter 13: Defendant’s Original Answer and Strategic Considerations for the Defense

13-1  INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 125
13-2  THE NEGLIGENCE OF THE PLAINTIFF .......................... 126
13-3  NO EXEMPLARY DAMAGES .............................................. 127
13-4  DESIGNATION OF RESPONSIBLE THIRD PARTY—DO IT PREEMPTIVELY TO NULLIFY LATER NONSUIT BY THE PLAINTIFF ........................ 128
13-5  ASSERT THE SAFE HARBOR DEFENSE? MAYBE ................. 130
13-6  STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE DEFENSE ........... 131
13-7  THE SEATBELT DEFENSE IN DRAM SHOP CASES .... 134

### Chapter 14: Written Discovery

14-1  TO THE PLAINTIFF ......................................................... 137
   14-1:1 Sample List of Items to Include in Request for Production to Plaintiff(s) ......................................................... 138
14-2  INTERROGATORIES .......................................................... 142
   14-2:1 Sample Interrogatories for Defense Counsel .................. 142
14-3  TO THE DEFENDANT ........................................................ 145
   14-3:1 Sample List of Items to Include in Request for Production to Defendant Provider ................................................. 145
   14-3:2 Sample List of Items to Include in Request for Production to Defendant Bartender ................................................. 151
   14-3:3 Sample List of Items to Include in Request for Production to Defendant Drunk Driver or Intoxicated Person ............................................................ 152
14-4  SAMPLE INTERROGATORIES FOR PLAINTIFF COUNSEL .............................................................................. 154
   14-4:1 Sample Interrogatories for Individual Defendants ............ 158
   14-4:2 Sample Interrogatories for Drunk Driver Litigant ................ 162

### Chapter 15: Depositions

15-1  DEPOSING THE FIRST PARTY PLAINTIFF ......................... 167
15-2  DEPOSING THE SECOND PARTY PLAINTIFF ...................... 171
15-3  DEPOSING THE THIRD PARTY PLAINTIFF ....................... 173
15-4  DEPOSING THE DRUNK DRIVER ...................................... 175
15-5  DEPOSING THE DEFENSE WITNESSES .............................. 180
Table of Contents

Chapter 16: Toxicology and Expert Testimony ........................................... 185
  16-1 BACKGROUND .............................................................................. 185
  16-2 RETROGRADE EXTRAPOLATION .................................................. 186
  16-3 THE DUBOWSKI CHART AND EXPECTED SIGNS
      OF INTOXICATION AT VARIOUS LEVELS
      OF BLOOD ALCOHOL CONCENTRATION .................................. 188
  16-4 METABOLIC AND PHYSIOLOGIC TOLERANCE
      TO ALCOHOL .............................................................................. 189
  16-5 DEPOSING THE PLAINTIFF’S
      TOXICOLOGIST ............................................................................. 190
  16-6 THE RETENTION AND UTILIZATION OF THE
      DEFENSE TOXICOLOGIST ............................................................ 193
  16-7 THE SELECTION AND USE OF LIABILITY
      EXPERTS, IF ANY ......................................................................... 196
      16-7:1 Liability Experts for the Plaintiff ............................................ 196
      16-7:2 Liability Experts for the Defense ............................................ 199
  16-8 DEPOSING THE DEFENSE TOXICOLOGIST ................................. 200

Chapter 17: Motion in Limine .................................................................. 205
  17-1 THE PLAINTIFF’S MOTION IN LIMINE ....................................... 205
  17-2 THE DEFENDANT’S MOTION IN LIMINE ..................................... 212

Chapter 18: Jury Selection ................................................................. 219
  18-1 JURY SELECTION IN THE TRIAL
      OF DRAM SHOP CASES ............................................................... 219
  18-2 THE PLAINTIFF’S VOIR DIRE AND
      JURY SELECTION ......................................................................... 221
  18-3 VOIR DIRE AND JURY SELECTION
      FOR THE DEFENSE ....................................................................... 228

Chapter 19: Trying the Dram Shop Case to a Jury ......................... 233
  19-1 TRYING THE PLAINTIFF’S CASE .............................................. 233
  19-2 TRYING THE DEFENDANT’S CASE ............................................ 238
  19-3 FINAL ARGUMENT FOR THE PLAINTIFF ................................. 245
  19-4 FINAL ARGUMENT FOR THE DEFENSE ................................. 247

Appendix: Forms .................................................................................. 251
  1:1 PLAINTIFF’S PETITION, SAMPLE A ............................................. 253
  1:2 PLAINTIFF’S PETITION, SAMPLE B ............................................. 261
  1:3 DEFENDANT’S MOTION TO TRANSFER VENUE
      AND ORIGINAL ANSWER ........................................................... 267
Table of Contents

1:4  DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO TRANSFER VENUE, ANSWER AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO DESIGNATE RESPONSIBLE THIRD PARTY, SUBJECT THERETO .......................................................... 272
1:5  DEFENDANT'S ANSWER TO MULTIPLE PLAINTIFFS AND MOTION FOR LEAVE TO DESIGNATE RESPONSIBLE THIRD PARTY ........................................... 278
1:6  PLAINTIFF'S OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO DESIGNATE RESPONSIBLE THIRD PARTY .......................................................... 285
1:7  DEFENDANT'S REPLY TO OBJECTION TO MOTION FOR LEAVE TO DESIGNATE RESPONSIBLE THIRD PARTY .......................................................... 290
1:8  REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION TO PLAINTIFF, SAMPLE A .................................................................................. 296
1:9  REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION TO PLAINTIFF, SAMPLE B .................................................................................. 303
1:10  REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION TO DRAM SHOP DEFENDANT .......................................................... 309
1:11  REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION TO DEFENDANT DRUNK DRIVER .......................................................... 318
1:12  INTERROGATORIES TO PLAINTIFF, SAMPLE A .... 323
1:13  INTERROGATORIES TO PLAINTIFF, SAMPLE B ...... 329
1:14  INTERROGATORIES TO DRAM SHOP DEFENDANT .................................................................................. 336
1:15  INTERROGATORIES TO DEFENDANT DRUNK DRIVER .................................................................................. 341
1:16  DEFENDANT'S NO EVIDENCE MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT .......................................................... 346
1:17  DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT .................................................................................. 352
1:18  DEFENDANT'S TRADITIONAL AND NO EVIDENCE MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT .......................................................... 362
1:19  PLAINTIFF’S MOTION IN LIMINE .......................................................... 396
1:20  DEFENDANT’S MOTION IN LIMINE .......................................................... 403
1:21  DRAM SHOP JURY CHARGE (CHARGE OF THE COURT) .................................................................................. 410
1:22  DEPOSITION OF PLAINTIFF’S TOXICOLOGY EXPERT .................................................................................. 428
Table of Contents

1:23 STAGES OF ACUTE ALCOHOLIC INFLUENCE/INTOXICATION (DUBOWSKI) ...............462
1:24 BAC POSTER ........................................................................................................463

Appendix: Texas Alcoholic Beverage Code ..........................................................465
1 Section 2.02. Causes of Action .................................................................466
2 Section 2.03. Exclusivity of Statutory Remedy .................................467
3 Section 106.14. Actions of Employee ..................................................467

Table of Cases .................................................................................................471

Index ..............................................................................................................475