

# Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1: Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
§1:01 Introduction to the Law of Insurer Bad Faith in Pennsylvania ...	1
§1:02 Bad Faith in Pennsylvania and Other Jurisdictions.....	2
§1:03 Common Law Bad Faith in Pennsylvania.....	2
§1:04 Issues Arising Under Pennsylvania’s Bad Faith Statute .....	3
§1:05 Court Decisions Concerning What May Be, and What is Not, Bad Faith.....	7
§1:06 Damages Recoverable in a Bad Faith Action .....	9
§1:07 Discovery in Bad Faith Litigation.....	10
§1:08 Additional Bad Faith Issues.....	11
<b>Chapter 2: Historical Development of Bad Faith .....</b>	<b>13</b>
§2:01 Overview.....	13
§2:02 Third Party Insurance Claims.....	14
§2:03 First Party Insurance Claims .....	15
§2:04 Development of the Law of Third Party Bad Faith in Other Jurisdictions.....	17
§2:05 Development of the Law of First Party Bad Faith in Other Jurisdictions.....	20
§2:06 The Development of the Law of Third Party Bad Faith in Pennsylvania.....	23
§2:07 Pre-1990 Law of First Party Bad Faith in Pennsylvania.....	25
§2:08 Pennsylvania’s Bad Faith Statute: 42 Pa.C.S.A. §8371.....	30
§2:09 Other Pennsylvania Remedies for Insurer Misconduct.....	32
<b>Chapter 3: Common Law Bad Faith in Pennsylvania .....</b>	<b>35</b>
§3:01 Overview.....	35
§3:02 The Seminal Case: <i>Cowden v. Aetna Casualty &amp; Surety Company</i> , 134 A.2d 223 (Pa. 1957).....	37
§3:03 Common Law Bad Faith Liability for Failure to Settle Claim Within Policy Limits.....	40
§3:04 —Cases.....	45
§3:05 Who May Assert a Third Party Bad Faith Claim.....	76
§3:06 —Cases.....	77

## Table of Contents

§3:07	Damages Recoverable for Failure to Settle a Third-Party Claim .....	84
§3:08	—Cases.....	85
§3:09	Interplay Between a § 8371 Claim and a Third Party Common Law Bad Faith Claim.....	91
§3:10	—Cases.....	93
§3:11	The Questionable Expansion of the Third Party Common Law Bad Faith Claim.....	106
§3:12	—Cases.....	108
§3:13	Commentary.....	122
 <b>Chapter 4: Parties to a Bad Faith Action Under §8371 .....</b>		<b>129</b>
§4:01	Overview.....	129
§4:02	Who May Bring a Bad Faith Action .....	130
§4:03	—Cases Allowing Party to Bring Bad Faith Action .....	139
§4:04	—Cases Disallowing Party to Bring Bad Faith Action.....	145
§4:05	—Assignment of the Right to Bring a Bad Faith Claim .....	169
§4:06	—Validity of a Non-Assignment Clause.....	176
§4:07	Who May Be Sued for Bad Faith .....	182
§4:08	—Cases.....	186
§4:09	Commentary.....	200
 <b>Chapter 5: The Nature and Scope of an Action Under §8371.....</b>		<b>205</b>
§5:01	Overview.....	206
§5:02	§8371 as an Independent Cause of Action .....	207
§5:03	The Evolving First Party Common Law Bad Faith Action .....	212
§5:03(a)	—Cases.....	216
§5:04	Relation of § 8371 Action to Breach of Contract Action.....	234
§5:04(a)	—Need For a “Predicate Action” .....	234
§5:04(b)	—Cases Involving Suit Limitation Clause in Policy .....	236
§5:04(c)	—Cases Where There Is No Coverage Under the Policy.....	241
§5:04(d)	—Cases Suggesting Bad Faith Claim May Proceed Irrespective of Whether There Is Coverage .....	250
§5:05	The Scope of Conduct Covered Under §8371 .....	264
§5:05(a)	—Cases Holding §8371 Applies to Bad Faith Toward an Insured, and Not to an Insurer’s General Business Practices.....	269
§5:05(b)	—Cases Holding §8371 Does Not Apply to Acts Preceding the Formation of Insurance Contract.....	272

## Table of Contents

§5:05(c) —Cases Suggesting §8371 Applies Only to Claims Denials and Claims Handling Issues.....	278
§5:05(d) —Cases More Broadly Interpreting §8371 .....	292
§5:06 Whether Sustaining of Damages Is a Predicate of a Bad Faith Action .....	303
§5:07 Whether Plaintiff in a Bad Faith Case Must Prove Causation .....	310
§5:08 Commentary.....	316
 <b>Chapter 6: Defining Bad Faith Under §8371 .....</b>	 <b>327</b>
§6:01 Overview.....	327
§6:02 A Two-Part Definition of Bad Faith .....	334
§6:02(a) —No Reasonable Basis for Denying a Claim.....	341
§6:02(b) —Knowing or Reckless Disregard of Lack of Reasonable Basis .....	348
§6:03 An Alternate Definition of Bad Faith? .....	357
§6:04 Is an Insurer a Fiduciary? .....	359
§6:05 —Cases.....	362
§6:06 Commentary.....	369
 <b>Chapter 7: Procedural Issues in Bad Faith Actions .....</b>	 <b>375</b>
§7:01(a) Overview.....	376
§7:01(b) Pleading Bad Faith .....	377
§7:02 —Cases, Plaintiff’s Pleading Found Insufficient .....	391
§7:03 —Cases, Plaintiff’s Pleading Found Sufficient .....	399
§7:04 Who Decides if Bad Faith Exists?.....	408
§7:04(a) —State Court Trials.....	410
§7:04(b) —Federal Court Trials.....	414
§7:04(c) —Arbitrations .....	417
§7:05 Commentary.....	422
§7:06 Ripeness of a Bad Faith Action.....	424
§7:07 The Applicable Burden of Proof for Bad Faith Actions .....	429
§7:08 Statute of Limitations Issues .....	435
§7:09 The Two-Year Statute of Limitations for §8371 Claims.....	437
§7:10 The Four-Year Statute of Limitations for Common Law Bad Faith Claims .....	442
§7:11 Application of the Statute of Limitations.....	446
§7:11(a) —Cases Holding That Statute of Limitations Expired .....	449
§7:11(b) —Cases Holding That Statute of Limitations Had Not Expired.....	467
§7:11(c) —Application of Limitation of Suit Provision in Policy ....	479
§7:12 Forum Selection Issues .....	483

## Table of Contents

§7:13	Venue in State Court .....	485
§7:14	Venue in Federal Court .....	492
§7:15	—Cases, Federal Jurisdiction Allowed .....	498
§7:16	—Cases, Federal Jurisdiction Denied.....	513
§7:17	Commentary.....	528
§7:18	Motions for Summary Judgment .....	532
§7:18(a)	—Cases Discussing Evidentiary Burden in Opposing Summary Judgment .....	534
§7:18(b)	—Summary Judgment in Favor of Insurer .....	540
§7:18(c)	—Summary Judgment in Favor of Insured .....	543
§7:19	Bifurcation or Severance.....	544
§7:20	—Cases Allowing Bifurcation.....	549
§7:21	—Cases Not Allowing Bifurcation.....	560
§7:22	Bifurcation and Severance in Uninsured/Underinsured Motorist Claims.....	572
§7:22(a)	—Cases Permitting Bifurcation or Severance in UM/UIM Scenario.....	574
§7:22(b)	—Cases Not Permitting Bifurcation or Severance in UM/UIM Scenario.....	587
§7:22(c)	—Commentary .....	601
§7:23	Issues Involving Counsel.....	603
<b>Chapter 8: Proving Bad Faith.....</b>		<b>611</b>
§8:01	Overview.....	611
§8:02	The Unfair Insurance Practices Act (UIPA) and Related Regulations .....	613
§8:03	Violations of the UIPA and Regulations as Relevant on the Issue of Bad Faith.....	617
§8:04(a)	—State Court Cases .....	623
§8:04(b)	—Federal Court Cases .....	630
§8:05	Other Potential Indicators of Bad Faith Conduct.....	646
§8:06	Using Experts to Prove Bad Faith.....	650
§8:07	—Cases.....	654
§8:08	Commentary.....	678
<b>Chapter 9: Examples Where Courts Have Found Bad Faith May Exist.....</b>		<b>685</b>
§9:01	Overview.....	686
§9:02	Unreasonable Delay in Handling Claims .....	688
§9:03(a)	—Cases (Auto Claims).....	693
§9:03(b)	—Cases (Property Claims) .....	709
§9:03(c)	—Cases (Other Claims).....	721
§9:04	Inadequate Investigation or Legal Research.....	725

## Table of Contents

§9:05(a) —Cases (Auto Claims).....	735
§9:05(b) —Cases (Property Claims).....	758
§9:05(c) —Cases (Other Claims).....	775
§9:06 Unreasonable Reliance on Independent Experts.....	791
§9:07 —Cases.....	794
§9:08 Unreasonable Interpretation or Application of Policy Provisions .....	805
§9:09(a) —Cases (Auto Claims) .....	811
§9:09(b) —Cases (Property Claims).....	827
§9:09(c) —Cases (Other Claims).....	841
§9:10 Unreasonable Claim Determination Regarding UM/UIM Coverage .....	848
§9:11 —Cases.....	853
§9:12 Failure to Make Reasonable Offer of Settlement .....	870
§9:13(a) —Cases (Auto Claims) .....	877
§9:13(b) —Cases (Property Claims).....	898
§9:13(c) —Cases (Other Claims).....	904
§9:14 Misrepresentation of Facts or Policy Provisions .....	909
§9:15 —Cases.....	912
§9:16 Unreasonable Refusal to Defend Third Party Suit.....	928
§9:17 —Cases.....	931
§9:18 Other Improper Conduct by Insurer .....	945
§9:19 —Cases.....	947
§9:20 Litigation Conduct As Potentially Indicative of Bad Faith.....	961
§9:21(a) —Cases, Insurer Decision to Bring Litigation Against Its Insured.....	966
§9:21(b) —Cases, Conduct by Insurer or Counsel After the Institution of Litigation.....	971
§9:22 Releases .....	980
§9:23 —Cases.....	981
§9:24 Commentary.....	984

**Chapter 10: Examples Where Bad Faith Has Been Found Not  
to Exist..... 985**

§10:01 Overview.....	986
§10:02 Insurer Correctly Applies Policy Provisions in Denying Third Party Coverage.....	988
§10:02(a) —Cases.....	991
§10:03 Insurer Correctly Applies Policy Provisions in Determining First Party Claim .....	1008
§10:03(a) —Cases, Auto .....	1015

**Table of Contents**

§10:03(b) —Cases, Property..... 1031  
 §10:03(c) —Cases, Life/Health/Disability/Other..... 1044  
 §10:04 Insurer’s Interpretation of Policy, Though Wrong, Was Reasonable..... 1050  
 §10:05(a) —Cases, Auto ..... 1057  
 §10:05(b) —Cases, Property..... 1066  
 §10:05(c) —Cases, Life/Health/Disability/Other..... 1072  
 §10:06 Insurer’s Investigation and Claims Decision Was Reasonable... 1080  
 §10:07(a) —Cases (Auto Claims) ..... 1093  
 §10:07(b) —Cases (Property Claims) ..... 1113  
 §10:07(c) —Cases (Life/Health/Disability Claims)..... 1139  
 §10:07(d) —Cases (Liability and Other Claims)..... 1152  
 §10:08 Insurer Reasonably Interprets Applicable Legal Precedent ... 1164  
 §10:09 —Cases..... 1167  
 §10:10 Insurer’s Reasonable Reliance Upon Independent Experts ... 1174  
 §10:11 —Cases..... 1177  
 §10:12 Claim Handled in a Reasonably Timely Manner ..... 1188  
 §10:13(a) —Cases (Auto Claims) ..... 1196  
 §10:13(b) —Cases (Property Claims) ..... 1217  
 §10:13(c) —Cases (Life/Health/Disability Claims)..... 1228  
 §10:13(d) —Cases (Other Claims)..... 1233  
 §10:14 Possible Misrepresentation/Fraud by Insured ..... 1235  
 §10:15 —Cases..... 1238  
 §10:16 Reasonable Handling of UM/UIM Claim ..... 1250  
 §10:17 —Cases..... 1259  
 §10:18 Insurer Takes Reasonable Position Regarding Settlement ..... 1289  
 §10:19 —Cases..... 1296  
 §10:20 Litigation Conduct Held As Not Indicative of Bad Faith..... 1326  
 §10:21(a) —Cases Involving Insurer Decision to Bring Litigation Against Its Insured ..... 1331  
 §10:21(b) —Cases Involving Conduct by Insurer or Counsel After the Institution of Litigation..... 1337  
 §10:22 Releases ..... 1365  
 §10:23 —Cases..... 1367  
 §10:24 Miscellaneous Allegations Held Not to Constitute Bad Faith... 1375  
 §10:25 —Cases..... 1379  
 §10:26 Commentary on Selected Bad Faith Topics ..... 1391

**Chapter 11: Damages Recoverable: Attorneys’ Fees, Costs and Interest ..... 1423**  
 §11:01 Overview..... 1423  
 §11:02 Cases Addressing Attorneys’ Fees..... 1429

## Table of Contents

§11:03 Cases Addressing Interest and Costs.....	1456
§11:04 Commentary.....	1466
<b>Chapter 12: Damages Recoverable: Compensatory Damages.....</b>	<b>1471</b>
§12:01 Overview.....	1471
§12:02 Cases.....	1475
§12:03 Commentary.....	1501
<b>Chapter 13: Damages Recoverable: Punitive Damages.....</b>	<b>1507</b>
§13:01 Overview.....	1507
§13:02 Pennsylvania Law of Punitive Damages .....	1509
§13:03 Is More Than Bad Faith Required for Imposition of Punitive Damages?.....	1511
§13:04 Cases Discussing What Must Be Proven to Recover Punitive Damages Under Pennsylvania’s Bad Faith Statute.....	1514
§13:05 Limits on Punitive Damages Awards .....	1525
§13:06 Pennsylvania Bad Faith Cases Discussing the Extent of and Limits on Punitive Awards.....	1536
§13:07 Commentary.....	1563
<b>Chapter 14: Discovery in Bad Faith Litigation.....</b>	<b>1571</b>
§14:01 Overview.....	1572
§14:02 Production of the Insurer’s Claim File.....	1574
§14:03 —Cases.....	1575
§14:04 Attorney Communications and Work Product.....	1584
§14:05(a) —Cases, State Court .....	1595
§14:05(b) —Cases, Federal Court .....	1614
§14:06 Production of Claims Manuals and Educational Materials ...	1635
§14:07 —Cases.....	1638
§14:08 Production of Underwriting Policies and Guidelines .....	1651
§14:09 —Cases.....	1652
§14:10 Insurer’s Handling of Other Unrelated Claims, Lawsuits, or Policies .....	1655
§14:11 —Cases.....	1658
§14:12 Reserve Information .....	1674
§14:13 —Cases, Discovery of Reserve Information Permitted .....	1677
§14:14 —Cases, Discovery of Reserve Information Not Permitted ...	1686
§14:15 Evaluation, Selection and Compensation of Insurer’s Employees or Agents .....	1695
§14:16 —Cases.....	1698
§14:17 Corporate and Financial Information.....	1710
§14:18 —Cases.....	1711
§14:19 Miscellaneous Discovery Topics .....	1720

## Table of Contents

§14:20 —Cases.....	1723
§14:21 Commentary.....	1740
<b>Chapter 15: Application of Bad Faith to Medical and Wage Loss Claims Under the Motor Vehicle Financial Responsibility Law .....</b>	<b>1761</b>
§15:01 Overview.....	1761
§15:02 Cases Involving Determination by Peer Review Organization That Medical Treatment is Not Reasonable and Necessary.....	1766
§15:03 Cases Involving Other Allegations Concerning Requests for Medical Benefits.....	1776
§15:04 Cases Involving Requests for Wage Loss Benefits .....	1790
<b>Chapter 16: Reverse Bad Faith.....</b>	<b>1793</b>
§16:01 Overview.....	1793
§16:02 Reverse Bad Faith in Other Jurisdictions .....	1795
§16:03 Comparative Bad Faith in Other Jurisdictions .....	1796
§16:04 Pennsylvania Cases Discussing Reverse Bad Faith.....	1798
§16:05 Commentary.....	1808
<b>Chapter 17: Additional Issues Under the Bad Faith Statute .....</b>	<b>1811</b>
§17:01 ERISA and Bad Faith .....	1811
§17:02 U.S. Supreme Court Decisions Regarding ERISA Preemption....	1813
§17:03 Decisions Within the Third Circuit Regarding ERISA Preemption .....	1816
§17:04 —Selected Cases .....	1818
§17:05 Pennsylvania Workers’ Compensation Act and Bad Faith ...	1824
§17:06 —Cases.....	1826
§17:07 Other Federal and State Statutes and Bad Faith .....	1832
§17:08 —Cases.....	1832
<b>Chapter 18: The Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law and Insurer Bad Faith.....</b>	<b>1841</b>
§18:01 Introduction .....	1841
§18:02 Selected Cases Discussing the UTPCPL in Connection with Bad Faith Claims .....	1845
<b>Verdicts Appendix.....</b>	<b>1867</b>
<b>Table of Cases.....</b>	<b>1877</b>
<b>Index .....</b>	<b>1949</b>
<b>Selected Bibliography .....</b>	<b>1963</b>