TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

The Structure of Environmental Enforcement

§ 1.01 Introduction 1-2
§ 1.02 Absence of a Comprehensive Approach 1-3
§ 1.03 The EPA's Enforcement Structure 1-6
[1] Historical Underpinnings: From Fragmentation to "De-Balkanization" 1-6
[2] EPA's Present Enforcement Structures 1-7
[3] Consolidated Approach to Enforcement: Multimedia 1-8
[4] EPA's Trial Attorneys—The Department of Justice 1-11
§ 1.04 The Federal/State Relationship 1-13
[1] Overview 1-13
[2] The Delegation Process 1-13
[3] Parallel Proceedings, Overfiling and Judicial Abstention 1-17
[a] Parallel Proceedings 1-17
[b] Overfiling 1-18
[c] Abstention 1-26
[4] Double Jeopardy 1-28
§ 1.05 The Government's Pre-Litigation Enforcement Authority 1-31
§ 1.05A Agency Decisions and Rule Making 1-34
[1] The Administrative Record 1-35
[2] Threshold Barriers to Review 1-42
[a] Standing 1-42
[i] Procedural Aspects of Standing 1-42
[ii] Proof of Standing 1-43
[iii] Organizational Standing 1-43
[iv] Standing in Climate Change Cases 1-44

[b] Exhaustion. 1-45
[c] Ripeness 1-46
[3] The Final Agency Action Requirement 1-48
[4] Judicial Deference to Agency Action 1-51
§ 1.06 Citizen Suits 1-57
§ 1.07 The Criminalization of Environmental Enforcement 1-60
§ 1.08 The Politics of Environmental Enforcement 1-62
[1] Generally 1-62
[2] The Novel Coronavirus: A Case Study 1-62
§ 1.09 Conclusion 1-65

CHAPTER 2

The Statutory Power to Investigate

§ 2.01 Overview 2-2
[1] Administrative Subpoenas and Agency Interrogatories 2-2
[2] Statutory Reporting Requirements 2-2
[3] Intrusive Inspections and Searches. 2-3
§ 2.02 The Statutory Framework 2-5
[1] Comprehensive Environmental Response, Cleanup and Liability Act 2-5
[a] Section 104(e) Information Requests . . . 2-5
[b] Power to Inspect. 2-12
[c] Sanctions. 2-13
[d] Administrative Subpoenas 2-13
[2] Resource Conservation and Recovery Act 2-15
[a] Power to Inspect. 2-15
[b] Enforcement and Sanctions 2-16
[3] Clean Water Act 2-17
[a] Discharge Monitoring Reports. 2-17
[b] Inspections 2-20
[c] Sanctions. 2-21
[4] Clean Air Act 2-26
[a] Inspections 2-27
[b] Self-Monitoring and Reporting Requirements 2-29
[c] Administrative Subpoenas 2-30
[d] Sanctions. 2-31
[5] Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act. 2-36
[a] Providing Information 2-36
[b] Sanctions. 2-39
[6] Frank R. Lautenberg Chemical Safety for the 21st Century Act (Toxic Substances Control Act) 2-40

[a] Inspections 2-41
[b] Sanctions 2-42
[7] Other Environmental Acts with Information Provisions 2-42

CHAPTER 3

Dealing with Government Investigatory Demands

§ 3.01 Introduction 3-2
§ 3.02 Difficulty of Obtaining Meaningful Review of Government Investigatory Demands 3-3
[1] Pre-Enforcement Review 3-3
[2] Standards of Review 3-4
§ 3.03 The Government's Demand for Entry 3-5
[1] Responding to Demands for Entry and Inspection 3-5
[2] Restraints on Civil Inspections 3-5
[3] Standards for Obtaining an Administrative Warrant 3-10
[4] Warrantless Inspection Pursuant to Statutory Authority 3-17
§ 3.04 Scope of Response to an Information Request 3-24
[1] What Kind of Information Must Be Provided? 3-24
[a] Financial Information 3-24
[i] Financial Records 3-24
[ii] Financial Information from Parent Entities 3-25
[b] Redundant Information 3-26
[2] Scope of Investigation by Recipient 3-26
[3] Assertions of Confidentiality and Privilege 3-29
[a] Trade Secrets 3-29
[b] Privilege 3-30
[i] Attorney-Client Privilege 3-32
[ii] Attorney Work-Product 3-38
[iii] Self-Critical Analysis 3-42
[4] Can the Government Speak with a Facility's Employees? 3-44
§ 3.05 "Reasonable Basis" 3-46
[1] Sufficient Cause 3-46
[2] The Paperwork Reduction Act 3-49
§ 3.06 Application of Sanctions for Insufficient Response 3-51
§ 3.07 The Takings Issue 3-55
§ 3.08 Combining Statutes for Tougher Results 3-57
§ 3.09 Handling the Investigatory Stage 3-58
[1] Mixed Questions of Law, Fact and Tactics . . . 3-58

[2] Written Requests for Information. 3-58
[3] Reporting Requirements Incident to Permits and Regulated Activities 3-59
[4] Inspections and Administrative Searches. . . . 3-59
§ 3.10 Conclusion. 3-61

CHAPTER 4

Penalties and Penalty Policies

§ 4.01 Introduction 4-2
[1] Overview 4-2
[2] Distinguishing Civil and Criminal Penalties 4-7
[3] The Environmental Appeals Board 4-10
[4] Chapter Preview 4-10
§ 4.02 Counting Violations 4-12
[1] General Description of the Problem. 4-12
§ 4.03 Statutory Criteria. 4-19
§ 4.04 The 1984 EPA Generic Policy on Civil Penalties 4-21
§ 4.05 The BEN Model: Determining Economic Benefit of Noncompliance 4-22
§ 4.06 The ABEL Model: Determining the Ability to Pay 4-27
§ 4.07 Statute-Specific Penalty Policies 4-29
[1] Clean Air Act Penalty Policies. 4-29
[a] Clean Air Act Stationary Source Penalty Policy 4-29
[i] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance 4-29
[ii] Gravity Component 4-30
[b] Supplementary Clean Air Act Penalty Policies 4-32
[2] The RCRA Civil Penalty Policy 4-36
[a] Gravity 4-36
[b] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance 4-38
[c] Adjustment Factors. 4-38
[i] Good Faith Efforts to Comply . . . 4-38
[ii] Degree of Willfulness and/or Negligence 4-39
[iii] History of Noncompliance. 4-39
[iv] Ability to Pay 4-39
[v] Other Unique Factors. 4-40
[3] The Clean Water Act Civil Penalty Policies 4-40

[a] The General Clean Water Act Penalty Policy 4-40
[i] Clean Water Act Penalty Calculation 4-42
[ii] Economic Benefit 4-42
[iii] Gravity Component 4-43
[iv] Gravity Component Adjustment Factors 4-47
[v] Other Considerations 4-48
[b] The Clean Water Act Dredge and Fill Penalty Policy 4-49
[c] Judicial Decisions 4-50
[4] The CERCLA and EPCRA Penalty Policies 4-54
[a] Emergency Planning and Notification 4-54
[i] Nature of the Violation 4-55
[ii] Extent Level 4-57
[iii] Gravity Level 4-58
[iv] Circumstances 4-58
[v] Multi-Day Penalties 4-59
[vi] Penalty Factors Relating to the Violator 4-59
[b] Toxic Chemical Emissions Reports . . . 4-61
[c] CERCLA *De Minimis* and *De Micromis* Waste Contributors 4-67
[d] Calculating Amount of Civil Penalty Settlement and Punitive Damages for Failure to Comply with an Administrative Order 4-69
§ 4.08 Penalty Mitigation Through Environmental Benefit Projects 4-71

CHAPTER 5

Temporary Restraining Orders, Preliminary Injunctions, and Stays Pending Appeal in Environmental Litigation

§ 5.01 Introduction 5-2
§ 5.02 Rules Governing Interlocutory Injunctive Relief. . . . 5-4
§ 5.03 Preliminary Injunctions 5-6
[1] Standards for Granting Relief. 5-6
[a] The Second Circuit. 5-6
[b] The Ninth Circuit 5-7
[c] Other Circuits 5-8
[2] The Nature of Irreparable Injury 5-9
[a] Proof of Irreparable Harm 5-12

[b] Failure to Prove Irreparable Harm. . . . 5-15
[c] Balancing the Public Interest. 5-16
[d] Problems in Demonstrating Irreparable Injury in Air and Water Cases 5-18
[e] NEPA Cases 5-19
[3] Avoiding the Burden of Proving Irreparable Injury. 5-22
[a] General Rule. 5-22
[b] Analysis of Supreme Court Authority 5-22
[c] Statutory Basis 5-27
[d] Imminent Endangerment Provisions. . . 5-30
[4] Innovative Applications of Injunction in the Environmental Context 5-35
[5] Injunctions Against Regulatory Agencies 5-36
§ 5.04 Procedures for Obtaining a Preliminary Injunction 5-37
[1] Timing 5-37
[2] Required Documents. 5-37
[3] Affidavits. 5-38
[4] Other Supporting Material 5-38
[5] Live Testimony 5-39
[6] Use of Discovery. 5-39
[7] Consolidated or Accelerated Proceedings 5-39
§ 5.05 Strategy on Motions for a Preliminary Injunction:. 5-40
[1] Movant's Tactical Advantages 5-40
[2] Ascertaining the Necessity of a Hearing 5-40
[3] Movant's Preparation 5-40
[4] Beating the Trial Calendar 5-40
[5] Respondent's Tactics. 5-41
§ 5.06 Temporary Restraining Orders 5-42
[1] Nature of the Temporary Restraining Order 5-42
[2] *Ex Parte* Grants of TROs. 5-44
[3] Protection Against *Ex Parte* Grants. 5-45
[4] Emergency Nature of the TRO 5-46
§ 5.07 Other Aspects of Preliminary Injunctions and Temporary Restraining Orders. 5-47
[1] Findings and Conclusions. 5-47
[2] Orders 5-47
[3] Security for Preliminary Injunctions 5-48
§ 5.08 Motions for Stays Pending Appeal and Scope of Appellate Review. 5-51

CHAPTER 6

The Criminal Process in Environmental Regulation

§ 6.01 Overview: The Interface Between Environmental Law and Criminal Justice 6-2
[1] Unique Characteristics of the Criminal System. 6-4
[2] The Prosecutor. 6-4
[3] The Grand Jury 6-5
[4] Limitations on Defense Counsel 6-7
§ 6.02 Federal Law of Environmental Crimes 6-9
[1] Introduction 6-9
[2] The Development of the Environmental Criminal Statutes 6-9
[3] The Federal Statutes 6-10
[a] The Clean Air Act 6-10
[i] Development of the Statute 6-10
[ii] Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990. 6-12
[b] The Clean Water Act 6-16
[i] Development of the Statute 6-16
[ii] Clean Water Act of 1987. 6-17
[c] The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act 6-23
[i] Illegal Transportation and Disposal of Hazardous Waste 6-23
[ii] Material Omissions and Falsification of RCRA Records. 6-24
[iii] Destruction or Alteration of RCRA Records Relating to Non-Listed Wastes. 6-24
[iv] Knowing Endangerment. 6-27
[v] The "Mixture Rule" and the "Derived-From Rule" 6-30.2
[d] Regulation of Chemicals 6-32
[i] The Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act 6-32
[ii] The Toxic Substances Control Act 6-34
[e] Superfund 6-36.1
[f] Reporting Violations 6-37
§ 6.03 The Element of *Mens Rea* 6-42
[1] Introduction 6-42
[2] *Mens Rea* and RCRA 6-54
[2A] *Mens Rea* and the Clean Water Act. 6-61

[3] The Negligence Standard 6-64
[4] Exceptions to *Mens Rea*; the Misdemeanor . . . 6-66
[a] Public Welfare Statutes 6-66
[b] Responsible Corporate Officers 6-68
[c] Willful Blindness 6-73
[5] Mistake of Fact and Mistake of Law 6-74
[6] Corporate Liability for Individual Actions 6-75
[7] State Approaches to *Mens Rea* 6-76.1
§ 6.04 State Enforcement of Environmental Criminal Statutes 6-76.3

CHAPTER 7

Criminal Representation and Defense in Environmental Law

§ 7.01 The Defense of Alleged Environmental Crimes 7-2
[1] Reasons for the Institution of Criminal Proceedings 7-2
[2] Guidelines for the Initiation of Criminal Proceedings 7-3
[3] Conducting the Pretrial Defense 7-5
[4] The Use of Scientific Data 7-6
[5] Competing Tensions 7-10
[6] Structuring the Approach to the Prosecutor 7-12
§ 7.02 Representation of the Corporate Client 7-17
[1] General Considerations 7-17
[2] Violations Committed During the Corporate Response 7-17
[3] Interview of Employees 7-25
[4] Search and Seizure—Criminal Investigation at the Gate 7-26
[5] The Grand Jury 7-28
[6] The Corporate Response 7-29
[7] Relationship with the Corporation's Employees 7-33
[a] Nontarget Employees 7-33
[b] Targeted Employees 7-34
[8] Department of Justice Guidelines on Prosecuting Corporations 7-37
§ 7.03 Disposition of the Criminal Case 7-42.3
[1] Disposition and Global Considerations 7-42.3
[a] The Question: To Plead or Not to Plead 7-42.3
[b] The Federal Sentencing Guidelines 7-42.3
[c] Global Settlements 7-46

[d] Parallel Civil and Criminal Enforcement Proceedings 7-47
[2] Need for Confidentiality 7-54
[3] Plea Bargaining 7-55
[4] Structuring the Settlement of a Criminal Case 7-55
[5] Subsequent Civil Proceedings 7-55
[a] Suspension and Debarment 7-56
[i] Statutory Provisions 7-56
[ii] The Regulatory Framework 7-58
[b] SEC Disclosure 7-58.1
[c] Bad Actor Disqualifications 7-62
§ 7.04 Significance of Criminal Prosecution 7-65

CHAPTER 8

The Whys, Whens and Hows of Environmental Self-Auditing

§ 8.01 Introduction 8-3
§ 8.02 What Is an Environmental Audit? 8-7
[1] Introduction 8-7
[2] Sources for Guidance on Self-Policing and Auditing 8-8
[3] Substantive Goals of an Environmental Compliance Audit 8-9
§ 8.03 The Benefits of Effective Environmental Auditing . . . 8-10
[1] Introduction 8-10
[2] The Imposition of Significant Civil Penalties 8-10
[3] Economic Benefits of Environmental Auditing 8-11
[4] Exercising "Environmental Triage" 8-12
[a] Tort Liability 8-13
[b] Criminal Liability 8-13
[5] Mitigation of Penalties as a Result of an Existing Audit Program 8-13
[a] EPA Policy 8-14
[i] History of the EPA Auditing Policies 8-14
[ii] The EPA's 2000 Audit Policy . . . 8-15
[b] Department of Justice Policy 8-22
[c] The Federal Sentencing Guidelines . . . 8-23
[d] Self-Auditing Benefits Under Existing Federal Statute 8-23
[e] Self-Auditing Benefits Under Existing Federal Statute 8-25

[f] State Self-Auditing Privilege and Immunity Legislation. 8-25
[i] Typical Audit Privilege Legislation 8-26
[ii] Typical Audit Immunity Legislation 8-26
[6] Benefits Listed by the General Accounting Office 8-27
§ 8.04 How to Conduct an Effective Environmental Audit 8-28
[1] Dangers of Ineffective Auditing. 8-28
[2] Principles of Effective Environmental Auditing 8-28
[3] Who Should Conduct the Audit? 8-29
[a] Independent Auditors 8-29
[b] The Use of Counsel 8-30
[4] The Actual Performance of the Audit 8-32
[a] Overview of Concerns 8-32
[b] The Audit Process 8-33
[c] Management Commitment: Designing the Scope of the Audit and the Use of Checklists. 8-33
[d] Review of Available Institutional Records 8-34
[e] The Auditor's Areas of Concern 8-35
[f] Prior Directives, Orders and Consent Decrees 8-36
[g] Discharge of Waste Water. 8-36
[h] Air Emissions 8-37
[i] Treatment, Storage and the Disposal of Hazardous Wastes 8-37
[j] Above and Below Ground Storage Tanks 8-39
[k] Toxic Substances 8-39
[l] Superfund 8-39
[m] Reporting Requirements. 8-39
[5] Making Sure the Documents Are Accurate. . . . 8-40
[6] Employee Interviews: Getting the Facts 8-41
[7] The Facility Inspection 8-41
[8] Verification of Data 8-43
[9] Writing the Environmental Audit Report. . . . 8-45
[10] Review Reconciliation and Implementation . . . 8-46
§ 8.05 Minimizing the Risks Associated with Environmental Auditing 8-47
[1] The Risks. 8-47
[2] Maintaining, to the Greatest Extent Possible, the Confidentiality of the Audit. 8-47
[3] The Attorney-Client Privilege. 8-48

[a] The Requisite Elements of the Privilege 8-48
[b] Waiver of the Privilege 8-50
[c] The Limits of the Privilege 8-52
[d] Recommended Practices for Document Creation, Handling, Distribution and Storage 8-53
[4] The Work Product Doctrine 8-53
[5] The Self-Evaluation Privilege. 8-60
[a] Judicial Development 8-60
[6] The Risk of Waiver Through Prosecution 8-61
§ 8.06 Environmental Compliance Procedures Beyond Auditing 8-62
[1] Auditing and Environmental Management 8-62
[a] Line Management Attention to Compliance 8-62
[b] Integration of Environmental Policies, Standards and Procedures 8-63
[c] Auditing, Monitoring, Reporting and Tracking 8-63
[i] Frequent Auditing. 8-63
[ii] Continuous On-Site Monitoring 8-63
[iii] Internal Reporting. 8-63
[iv] Tracking Response Status 8-64
[v] Redundant Checks 8-64
[d] Employee Training 8-64
[e] Incentives for Compliance 8-64
[f] Discipline for Noncompliance 8-64
[2] The "ISO 14000" Standards 8-65
[3] EMS Software 8-70.2
[4] The CERES Principles 8-71
§ 8.07 Dealing With the Public and the Press 8-73
[1] Community Involvement. 8-73
[2] Dealing with the Press 8-73
§ 8.08 Conclusion 8-77

CHAPTER 9

Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Water Act

§ 9.01 Introduction 9-3
§ 9.02 Antecedents 9-4
§ 9.03 The Clean Water Act Amendments of 1972 9-6
§ 9.04 The Permit System 9-8
[1] Navigable Waters 9-11
[2] Point Sources. 9-16
[3] National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits 9-22.2

[4] State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits 9-22.3
[5] Technology-Based and Water-Quality-Based Standards 9-22.5
[a] Technology-Based Standards 9-22.5
[b] Water-Quality-Based Standards 9-23
[6] Water Quality Criteria for Toxics 9-24
[7] Toxic Pollutant Standards 9-24.2
[8] State Standards 9-24.3
§ 9.05 The Pretreatment Regulatory Program 9-25
[1] Introduction 9-25
[2] Prohibited Discharges 9-26
[3] Categorical Standards 9-27
[4] Other Controls 9-28
§ 9.06 Nonpoint Source Control 9-30
[1] Stormwater Pollution 9-31
[2] Federal Regulation of Stormwater Discharges 9-31
[a] Stormwater from Industrial Activities 9-32
[b] Municipal Separate Sewer Systems . . . 9-34
[c] Stormwater from Construction Activities 9-34
§ 9.07 Wetlands 9-37
[1] Introduction 9-37
[2] Potentially Liable Parties 9-40
[3] Administrative Enforcement 9-40
[4] Civil Judicial Enforcement 9-42.1
[5] Settlement 9-44
[6] Governmental Policy 9-44
[7] Criminal Enforcement 9-44
§ 9.08 Oil Spills 9-46
§ 9.09 Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Water Act 9-49
[1] Varied Enforcement 9-49
[2] Discretion in Enforcement 9-49
[3] Federal Enforcement 9-50
[4] Administrative Enforcement 9-51
[5] Court Injunctions 9-53
[6] Emergency Power 9-54
[7] Citizen Suits 9-55
§ 9.10 Defenses 9-57
[1] Introduction 9-57
[2] Initial Considerations 9-57
[a] Permit Writing 9-57
[i] Mixing Zones 9-60
[ii] Biologically Available Metals . . . 9-61
[iii] Minimum Levels of Quantification for Discharge Permit Limits 9-62

[iv] Cooling Water Intake Structures 9-63
[b] Variances. 9-65
[i] The Fundamentally Different Factors Variance 9-65
[ii] Section 301(g) Variance. 9-65
[iii] Thermal Discharges 9-66
[iv] "Variances" From Water Quality Standards. 9-66
[v] Intake Water 9-68
[c] The Anti-Backsliding Provision. 9-68
[d] Well-Trained Personnel 9-70
[e] Fast Action in the Event of Exceedance. 9-70
[3] Bypasses and Upsets. 9-70
[a] Upsets 9-71
[b] Bypasses 9-73
[4] Sampling Error 9-74
[5] The Permit Shield 9-76
[6] Violation-Counting Issues. 9-77
[7] Litigating the Penalty 9-80
[8] Defenses in Citizen Suits 9-83
[a] Inadequate Notice. 9-83
[b] Wholly Past Violation 9-83
[c] Prior State or Federal Enforcement 9-84
[d] State Provisions More Stringent Than Federal Provisions 9-84
[9] Inadequate Defenses 9-84
[a] Good Faith Effort Not a Reliable Defense 9-84
[b] Economic or Business Necessity Not a Defense 9-85
[c] Impossibility 9-85

CHAPTER 10

Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Air Act

§ 10.01 Introduction 10-1
§ 10.02 The Clean Air Act's Alphabet Soup: NAAQS, NESHAPs and SIPs 10-3
[1] NAAQS 10-3
[2] NESHAPs 10-5
[3] SIPs 10-7
§ 10.03 The Clean Air Act's Title V Permit Program. 10-9
[1] Permits and Parameters. 10-13
[2] Allaying the Fears of Business. 10-15
§ 10.04 Information Gathering. 10-17

§ 10.05 Federal Enforcement Provisions 10-25
[1] Compliance Orders 10-27
[2] Administrative Penalties 10-29
[3] Field Citations 10-31
[4] Federal Court Action. 10-32
[5] Judicial Review 10-33
[6] Newer Federal Enforcement Tools. 10-34
[7] Civil Penalty Policies 10-40
§ 10.06 Defenses Under the Clean Air Act 10-53
§ 10.07 Climate Change Enforcement. 10-62

CHAPTER 11

Civil Enforcement Under the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act

§ 11.01 Introduction 11-2
§ 11.02 The Management of Hazardous Waste 11-4.1
[1] Solid Waste 11-4.1
[2] Hazardous Waste. 11-7
[3] The Subpart C Characteristics 11-9
[4] Testing for the Toxicity Characteristic 11-10
[5] The Part 261 Subpart D Lists. 11-11
[6] Special Provisions for Certain Hazardous Waste 11-12.1
[7] Generators of Hazardous Waste 11-17
[a] Generators' Manifest Requirements. . . . 11-19
[b] Generators' Pre-Transport Requirements 11-21
[c] Generators' Recordkeeping and Reporting 11-22
[d] Exports by Generators 11-23
[8] Transporters of Hazardous Waste 11-24
[9] TSD Owners or Operators 11-25
[a] On-Site Generators Storing Wastes Less Than Ninety Days 11-25
[b] All Other Owners and Operators. 11-26
[10] Corrective Action 11-27
[a] Applicability 11-28
[b] Regulatory Requirements for Corrective Action. 11-29
[c] Corrective Action Management Units. 11-29
[d] Temporary Units. 11-30
[e] What Is a Facility for Corrective Action Purposes? 11-30
[f] Corrective Action and Contribution. . . . 11-31
[11] Land Disposal Restrictions 11-31

§ 11.03 Regulation of Underground Storage Tanks 11-33
§ 11.04 Permits 11-37
§ 11.05 Federal Enforcement 11-39
[1] Compliance Orders, Administrative Penalties and Injunctive Relief 11-42
[2] Civil Penalties 11-43
[a] Gravity 11-43
[b] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance 11-44
[c] Adjustment Factors 11-44
[i] Good Faith Efforts to Comply . . . 11-45
[ii] Degree of Willfulness and/or Negligence 11-45
[iii] History of Noncompliance 11-45
[iv] Ability to Pay 11-45
[v] Other Unique Factors 11-46
[3] Interim Status Corrective Action 11-46
[4] Consent Orders 11-46
[5] Criminal Action 11-48
[6] The Likelihood of Enforcement 11-49
[7] What to Expect in a RCRA Investigation 11-51
§ 11.06 State Reinforcement 11-53
[1] The Statutory Requirements 11-53
[2] The RCRA Grant Program 11-53
§ 11.07 Defenses 11-55
[1] Statutory Defenses 11-57
[2] Definitional Defenses 11-57
[3] Procedural Defenses 11-59
[4] Regulatory Exclusions 11-63
[5] Other Defenses 11-64
[a] Recycling 11-64
[b] Safe Storage 11-65
[c] Compliance with Other Statutes 11-65
[d] The Household Waste Exclusion 11-66
§ 11.08 Citizen Suits 11-67

CHAPTER 12

Structure of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act

§ 12.01 Overview of CERCLA 12-3
[1] Introduction 12-3
[2] Hastily Drafted Legislation 12-4
[3] Basic Structure of CERCLA 12-9
[a] Five Basic Components 12-9
[b] Liability: Strict, Retroactive, and Perhaps Joint and Several 12-11

[i] Strict Liability 12-12
[ii] Retroactive Liability 12-13
[iii] Joint and Several Liability Under CERCLA 12-15
[4] Causation 12-17
§ 12.02 The National Priorities List 12-20.2
[1] Introduction 12-20.2
[2] How Sites Are Listed 12-21
[a] The State Role in Site Selection 12-22
[b] The Hazard Ranking System 12-23
[c] Listing Because of Health Threats . . . 12-24
[d] Delisting After Cleanup 12-24
§ 12.03 The National Contingency Plan 12-26
§ 12.04 The Heart of CERCLA—Section 107 Liability 12-30
[1] Parties Liable 12-30
[a] Current Owners and Operators 12-31
[i] Lessors and Lessees 12-36
[ii] Banks and Financing Institutions 12-38
[iii] Past Owners 12-41
[b] Liability of Arrangers or Generators 12-44
[c] Liability of Transporters 12-48
[d] Statutory and Common Law Approaches to Finding Additional Solvent Parties 12-49
[i] Parent and Subsidiary Corporations 12-50
[ii] "Direct" CERCLA Statutory Liability 12-52
[iii] "Indirect" CERCLA Liability Through Developing Common Law 12-58
[e] Continuity of Enterprise – Mere Continuation Test in Detail 12-65
§ 12.05 Defenses 12-66.1
[1] Standard Statutory Defenses 12-66.1
[a] Act of God 12-66.1
[b] Act of War 12-66.2
[c] Third Party Defense 12-66.2
[2] Other Statutory Defenses 12-66.4
[a] The Innocent Purchaser Defense 12-66.4
[b] Secured Creditor Defense 12-66.6
[c] The Consumer Product Exception 12-66.7
[d] The Scope of "Release" to the "Environment" 12-66.9
[e] The Petroleum Exclusion 12-66.10
[f] The Pesticide Exclusion 12-66.11
[g] Federally Permitted Release 12-66.11

[h] Naturally Occurring Substances. 12-66.13
[i] Statute of Limitations. 12-66.13
[j] Recycling 12-66.20
[3] The Small Business Liability Relief and Brownfields Revitalization Act 12-66.21
[a] Liability Defenses for "*De Micromis*" Waste and Municipal Solid Waste 12-66.21
[b] Ability to Pay 12-66.22
[c] Contiguous Property Defense 12-66.23
[d] *Bona Fide* Prospective Purchaser 12-66.24
[e] Amendments to the Innocent Landowner Defense. 12-66.26
[f] Limits on Federal Response Actions at Sites Subject to Response Actions Pursuant to State Law 12-66.30
§ 12.06 Costs of Response. 12-66.31
[1] Limited Damages 12-66.31
[2] Removal and Remediation Costs 12-66.33
[3] Oversight and Indirect Costs 12-66.34
[4] Interest 12-66.35
[5] Determining the Necessity of Response Costs. 12-66.36
§ 12.07 Cleanup Standards for Response Actions 12-67
[1] Introduction 12-67
[2] Statutory Basis. 12-67
[a] Preference for Permanent Remedies and On-Site Treatment 12-68
[b] Considerations for Alternative Remedies 12-68
[3] Degree of Cleanup 12-70
[4] Standards for On-Site Cleanups 12-73
[5] Standards Applicable to Off-Site Transfers. . . . 12-75
§ 12.08 Natural Resource Damages. 12-76
[1] Introduction: The Statutory and Regulatory Scheme. 12-76
[a] Statutory Basis 12-76
[b] Regulatory Implementation 12-80
[i] Designation of the Trustee. 12-81
[ii] Assessment of Damages. 12-81
[c] What Constitutes a Natural Resource?. 12-82
[2] Natural Resource Damage Defenses 12-84
[a] Limitation on Costs 12-84
[b] Date of Injury to Natural Resource. . . . 12-84
[c] Statute of Limitations. 12-86
[d] Environmental Impact Statement or Permit Language 12-87
[e] The Trustee's Authority. 12-89

CHAPTER 13

Enforcement and Initiatives Under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act

§ 13.01 Government Enforcement 13-3
[1] Overview of EPA Enforcement Approaches 13-3
[2] Fund-Financed Actions 13-4
[3] Unilateral Remediation Orders Under Section 106 13-6
[a] Introduction 13-6
[b] The Statutory Scheme 13-7
[c] Government Enforcement Policy Under Section 106 13-10
[i] Introduction 13-10
[ii] What the EPA Looks for Before Issuing a Section 106 Order 13-13
[d] "Sufficient Cause" 13-14
[e] The Consequence of Section 106 Noncompliance 13-18
[f] Claims for Reimbursement from the Fund 13-20
[4] Challenges to Agency Listing Procedure 13-21
[a] Procedural Obstacles to Judicial Review 13-21
[b] Deferential Standard of Review 13-22.1
[c] Challenges on Technical Grounds 13-23
[5] Emerging Defenses 13-24
[a] The Government's Advantage 13-24
[b] Leveling the Legal Playing Field—Divisibility of Harm 13-25
[c] Unreasonable Response Costs 13-33
[d] Oversight Costs 13-34
[e] Retreat from Judicial Deference 13-35
[6] Administrative Reform and Enforcement 13-35
[a] Orphan Shares—Reform and Reality 13-36
[b] Partial NPL De-Listing 13-37
[c] Allocation Pilot Projects 13-38
§ 13.02 Litigation Strategies 13-39
[1] Government Litigation Strategies 13-39
[2] Defendant's Litigation Strategy 13-41
§ 13.03 Negotiated Settlements and Consent Decrees Under CERCLA 13-45
[1] Overview 13-45

[2] Statutory Framework 13-46
[a] Statutory Incentives to Settle 13-46
[i] Covenant Not to Sue 13-46
[ii] Contribution Protection 13-48
[iii] Other Actions 13-49
[iv] Nonsettlor Rights 13-50
[b] Lodging and Public Comment 13-50
[c] Intervention Issues 13-50
[i] Timeliness 13-51
[ii] Protectable Interest 13-51
[d] Effects of Settlement Agreement 13-52
[3] The EPA's Model Consent Decree 13-52
[a] Introduction 13-52
[b] Provisions of the Model Consent Decree 13-53
[c] Changes Effected by the Revised Model Consent Decree 13-54
[d] Section 113(f)(3)(b) Contribution Claim Changes 13-56
[4] Negotiating the Consent Decree 13-57
[a] Contribution Protection and Opposition from Other Defendants 13-61
[i] "Equitable Share" or "Amount of Settlement"? 13-62
[ii] Government or Private Party Plaintiff? 13-62
[iii] Bar Orders Precluding Section 107 Cost Recovery Claims 13-64
[b] Settlement Litigation by Nonsettlors 13-65
§ 13.04 Private Claims for Relief Under CERCLA 13-68
[1] Express Claim for Relief 13-68
[2] Claims for Contribution and Claims for Cost Recovery 13-69
[a] Distinction Between Claims 13-69
[b] Pre-*Aviall* Caselaw 13-71
[c] *Aviall* and Post-*Aviall* Cases 13-72
[d] Right of Contribution 13-81
[e] Orphan Shares 13-83
[f] Allocation Standards 13-89
[g] PRP Allocation 13-98
[3] Consistency with the National Contingency Plan 13-100
[a] Substantial or Strict Compliance with the NCP 13-100
[b] Which NCP Applies? 13-103
[4] Tactics and Strategy 13-104
[a] Pleadings 13-104

[b] Third and Multiparty Practice 13-105
[c] Bifurcation 13-107
[d] Marshalling the Evidence. 13-108
[5] Response Costs Recoverable Under Section 107. 13-109
[6] Related Claims for Relief. 13-110
[7] Award of Attorneys' Fees 13-116
[a] Supreme Court Resolution of Conflicting Decisions Against General Recovery 13-116
[b] Distinctions Among Grants of Attorneys' Fees in Citizen Suits Under Sections 107, 113, and 310 of CERCLA 13-117
§ 13.05 Moving Toward the Future: Common Sense and Brownfields Initiatives 13-119

CHAPTER 14

Civil Enforcement Under the Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act (EPCRA)

§ 14.01 Overview 14-2
§ 14.02 Statutory and Regulatory Framework 14-5
[1] The Reporting Requirements 14-5
[a] Emergency Notification 14-5
[b] Material Safety Data Sheet 14-8
[c] Emergency and Hazardous Chemical Inventory Forms. 14-9
[d] Toxic Chemical Release Forms (Form R) 14-11
[e] Other Information Requirements 14-15
[f] Public Access to Chemical Safety Information. 14-16
[2] Statutory Enforcement Provisions 14-17
[a] Statutory Penalties for EPCRA Violations. 14-17
[i] Reporting Violations 14-17
[ii] Trade Secret Claim Violations. 14-20
[b] Who Enforces EPCRA. 14-20.1
§ 14.03 Defenses. 14-20.2
[1] Defenses to Liability. 14-20.2
[2] Defenses in Citizen Suits Under EPCRA 14-31
§ 14.04 EPCRA Civil Penalty Policies 14-34
[1] The Form R Penalty Policy 14-34

[a] The Basic Form R Penalty. 14-34
[b] Adjustments Factors 14-36
[i] Culpability. 14-36
[ii] Voluntary Disclosure 14-37
[iii] History of Prior Violations 14-37
[iv] Delisted Chemicals. 14-38
[v] Attitude 14-38
[vi] "Other Factors as Justice May Require". 14-38
[vii] Settlement with Conditions 14-39
[viii] Ability to Pay 14-39
[2] Penalty Policy for Other EPCRA Requirements 14-40
[a] Introduction. 14-40
[b] Calculating the Base Penalty 14-40
[i] The "Nature" of the Violation. 14-40
[ii] The "Extent" of the Violation. 14-41
[iii] The "Gravity" of the Violation. 14-43
[iv] "Circumstances" and the Base Penalty Matrices 14-44
[c] Assessment of Multi-Day Penalties . . . 14-46
[d] Individual Adjustment Factors. 14-46
[i] Ability to Pay 14-47
[ii] Prior History of Violations 14-47
[iii] Degree of Culpability. 14-47
[iv] Economic Benefit or Savings. . . . 14-48
[v] Other Matters as Justice May Require 14-48
[vi] Business Size 14-48
[vii] Attitude 14-49
[viii] Supplemental Environmental Projects. 14-49
[ix] Voluntary Disclosure 14-49
§ 14.05 Applying the EPCRA Penalty Policies 14-50

CHAPTER 15

Citizen Suits, and the Award of Attorneys' Fees in Environmental Litigation

§ 15.01 Overview 15-2
§ 15.02 Citizen Suits 15-5
[1] Legislative Intent. 15-5
[2] Statutory Provisions 15-6

[a] The Clean Water Act 15-9
[b] The Clean Air Act 15-12
[c] The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act 15-17
[d] Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act 15-25
[e] Toxic Substances Control Act 15-27
[f] Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act 15-28
[3] Preservation of Existing Remedies (Savings Clauses) 15-29
[4] Who May Sue 15-30
[5] Who May Be Sued 15-30
[6] Where Suit May Be Brought 15-32
[7] Private Intervention in Government Litigation 15-33
§ 15.03 Litigation Strategies 15-35
[1] Suits Against the Administrator 15-35
[2] Supplemental Claims for Relief 15-37
[3] Plaintiffs' Strategies 15-39
[a] Selection of Targets 15-39
[b] Thorough Investigation 15-40
[c] Maximize Number of Counts 15-40
[d] Timing of Litigation 15-40
[e] Relationship with Regulatory Agency 15-41
[f] Standing 15-41
[g] Pleading the Violation 15-41
[h] Increased Risk of Injury 15-41
[i] Aggressive Conduct 15-42
[j] Getting to Judgment 15-43
[4] Defense Strategies 15-43
[a] General Considerations 15-43
[b] Control of Reactions 15-43
[c] Dealing in Candor 15-43
[d] Using the Sixty- or Ninety-Day Window 15-43
[e] Fighting the Allegations of Wrongdoing 15-44
[f] Technical Defenses 15-44
[i] Lack of Standing 15-45
[ii] Lack of Notice 15-56
[iii] When Suit May Be Brought Immediately Upon Notice . . . 15-58
[iv] Statute of Limitations 15-59
[v] Wholly Past Violations 15-60
[vi] Mootness 15-68
[vii] Diligent Prosecution 15-70

[viii] Prior Resolution 15-76
[ix] Abstention and Primary Jurisdiction Doctrine 15-76
[x] Upset Defense to Clean Water Act Prosecutions 15-79
[g] Judicial Involvement 15-79
[h] Impleading the Environmental Agency 15-80
[i] Keeping an Eye on the Ball 15-80
[5] Settlement and Relief 15-80
[a] Negotiated Settlement 15-80
[b] Litigated Relief. 15-81
[c] Relief Requested. 15-81
§ 15.04 The Award of Attorneys' Fees. 15-83
[1] Introduction 15-83
[2] Non-Statutory Exception for Award of Attorneys' Fees. 15-83
[3] General Statutory Exceptions 15-84
[4] Statutory Provisions for the Award of Attorneys' Fees. 15-85
[5] Party Eligible for Award 15-86
[6] The Size of the Attorney's Fee 15-91
[7] Fees of Non-Testifying Experts 15-95
[8] Award of Fees for Preparation of Fee Application 15-95
[9] Procedures for Obtaining Attorneys' Fees . . . 15-96
§ 15.05 Conclusion. 15-98

INDEX I-1