# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1

The Structure of Environmental Enforcement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.01</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.02</td>
<td>Absence of a Comprehensive Approach</td>
<td>1-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.03</td>
<td>The EPA’s Enforcement Structure</td>
<td>1-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Historical Underpinnings: From Fragmentation to “De-Balkanization”</td>
<td>1-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>EPA’s Present Enforcement Structures</td>
<td>1-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>EPA’s Trial Attorneys—The Department of Justice</td>
<td>1-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.04</td>
<td>The Federal/State Relationship</td>
<td>1-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>1-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Parallel Proceedings, Overfiling and Judicial Abstention</td>
<td>1-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Parallel Proceedings</td>
<td>1-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Overfiling</td>
<td>1-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Abstention</td>
<td>1-26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.05</td>
<td>The Government’s Pre-Litigation Enforcement Authority</td>
<td>1-31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.05A</td>
<td>Agency Decisions and Rule Making</td>
<td>1-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>The Administrative Record</td>
<td>1-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Standing</td>
<td>1-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>Procedural Aspects of Standing</td>
<td>1-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii]</td>
<td>Proof of Standing</td>
<td>1-43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iii]</td>
<td>Organizational Standing</td>
<td>1-43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iv]</td>
<td>Standing in Climate Change Cases</td>
<td>1-44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 2

The Statutory Power to Investigate

§ 2.01 Overview ................................................................. 2-2
[3] Intrusive Inspections and Searches .......................................... 2-3

§ 2.02 The Statutory Framework .................................................. 2-5
  [a] Section 104(e) Information Requests .................................... 2-5
  [b] Power to Inspect .......................................................... 2-11
  [c] Sanctions ................................................................. 2-12
  [d] Administrative Subpoenas ............................................... 2-13
  [a] Power to Inspect .......................................................... 2-15
  [b] Enforcement and Sanctions ............................................... 2-16
[3] Clean Water Act ............................................................... 2-17
  [a] Discharge Monitoring Reports ............................................ 2-17
  [b] Inspections ............................................................... 2-19
  [c] Sanctions ................................................................. 2-21
[4] Clean Air Act ................................................................. 2-25
  [a] Inspections ............................................................... 2-27
  [b] Self-Monitoring and Reporting Requirements ......................... 2-29
  [c] Administrative Subpoenas ............................................... 2-30
  [d] Sanctions ................................................................. 2-30
  [a] Providing Information .................................................. 2-36
  [b] Sanctions ............................................................... 2-38
CHAPTER 3
Dealing with Government Investigatory Demands

§ 3.01 Introduction .................................................. 3-2

§ 3.02 Difficulty of Obtaining Meaningful Review of
Government Investigatory Demands ......................... 3-3
[1] Pre-Enforcement Review ................................. 3-3

§ 3.03 The Government’s Demand for Entry ............... 3-5
[1] Responding to Demands for Entry and
Inspection ......................................................... 3-5
[2] Restraints on Civil Inspections ......................... 3-5
[3] Standards for Obtaining an Administrative
Warrant ......................................................... 3-10
Authority ....................................................... 3-18

§ 3.04 Scope of Response to an Information Request ..... 3-22
[1] What Kind of Information Must Be
Provided? .......................................................... 3-22
[a] Financial Information ................................. 3-22
[i] Financial Records ................................. 3-22
[ii] Financial Information from
Parent Entities ............................................. 3-23
[b] Redundant Information .............................. 3-24
[3] Assertions of Confidentiality and
Privilege .......................................................... 3-28
[a] Trade Secrets ............................................. 3-28
[b] Privilege .................................................... 3-29
[i] Attorney-Client Privilege ......................... 3-31
[ii] Attorney Work-Product ......................... 3-36
[iii] Self-Critical Analysis ....................... 3-40
Facility’s Employees? ....................................... 3-41

§ 3.05 “Reasonable Basis” ........................................ 3-44
[1] Sufficient Cause ............................................ 3-44

§ 3.06 Application of Sanctions for Insufficient Response ... 3-49
§ 3.07 The Takings Issue ....................................... 3-52
§ 3.08 Combining Statutes for Tougher Results .......... 3-54
§ 3.09 Handling the Investigatory Stage ..................... 3-55

(Rel. 46)
CHAPTER 4
Penalties and Penalty Policies

§ 4.01 Introduction ........................................... 4-2
[1] Overview .............................................. 4-2
[2] Distinguishing Civil and Criminal Penalties ........... 4-7
[3] The Environmental Appeals Board .................. 4-10
[4] Chapter Preview ....................................... 4-10

§ 4.02 Counting Violations ................................ 4-12
[1] General Description of the Problem ............. 4-12

§ 4.03 Statutory Criteria ................................... 4-19

§ 4.04 The 1984 EPA Generic Policy on Civil Penalties .... 4-21

§ 4.05 The BEN Model: Determining Economic Benefit of Noncompliance ............................ 4-22

§ 4.06 The ABEL Model: Determining the Ability to Pay ........................................... 4-27

§ 4.07 Statute-Specific Penalty Policies ................. 4-29
[1] Clean Air Act Penalty Policies ....................... 4-29
   [a] Clean Air Act Stationary Source Penalty Policy ........ 4-29
      [i] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance .......... 4-29
      [ii] Gravity Component ....................... 4-30
   [b] Supplementary Clean Air Act Penalty Policies .... 4-32
   [a] Gravity ............................................ 4-37
   [b] Economic Benefit of Noncompliance ............ 4-38
   [c] Adjustment Factors ............................. 4-39
      [i] Good Faith Efforts to Comply ............... 4-39
      [ii] Degree of Willfulness and/or Negligence .... 4-39
   [iii] History of Noncompliance ................. 4-39
   [iv] Ability to Pay ................................ 4-39
   [v] Other Unique Factors ....................... 4-40
CHAPTER 5

Temporary Restraining Orders, Preliminary Injunctions, and Stays Pending Appeal in Environmental Litigation

§ 5.01 Introduction ........................................... 5-2
§ 5.02 Rules Governing Interlocutory Injunctive Relief ..... 5-4
§ 5.03 Preliminary Injunctions ................................. 5-6

[1] Standards for Granting Relief ........................... 5-6
   [a] The Second Circuit ................................ 5-6
   [b] The Ninth Circuit .................................. 5-7
   [c] Other Circuits ..................................... 5-8

   [a] Proof of Irreparable Harm ....................... 5-12
[b] Failure to Prove Irreparable Harm........5-15
[c] Balancing the Public Interest.........5-16
[d] Problems in Demonstrating Irreparable
    Injury in Air and Water Cases.......5-18
[e] NEPA Cases..........................5-19

[3] Avoiding the Burden of Proving Irreparable
    Injury.....................................5-22
   [a] General Rule..........................5-22
   [b] Analysis of Supreme Court
       Authority...............................5-22
   [c] Statutory Basis........................5-27
   [d] Imminent Endangerment Provisions...5-30

[4] Innovative Applications of Injunction in
    the Environmental Context.........5-35

[5] Injunctions Against Regulatory Agencies....5-36

§ 5.04 Procedures for Obtaining a Preliminary
    Injunction..................................5-37
   [1] Timing....................................5-37
   [2] Required Documents......................5-37
   [5] Live Testimony...........................5-39
   [6] Use of Discovery........................5-39
   [7] Consolidated or Accelerated Proceedings....5-39

§ 5.05 Strategy on Motions for a Preliminary
    Injunction...................................5-40
   [2] Ascertaining the Necessity of a Hearing...5-40
   [4] Beating the Trial Calendar..............5-40
   [5] Respondent’s Tactics....................5-41

§ 5.06 Temporary Restraining Orders...............5-42
   [1] Nature of the Temporary Restraining
       Order......................................5-42
   [2] Ex Parte Grants of TROs................5-44
   [3] Protection Against Ex Parte Grants.....5-45

§ 5.07 Other Aspects of Preliminary Injunctions and
    Temporary Restraining Orders...........5-47
   [1] Findings and Conclusions...............5-47
   [2] Orders....................................5-47

§ 5.08 Motions for Stays Pending Appeal and Scope
    of Appellate Review......................5-51
# CHAPTER 6

## The Criminal Process in Environmental Regulation

### § 6.01 Overview: The Interface Between Environmental Law and Criminal Justice

| [1] | Unique Characteristics of the Criminal System | 6-4 |
| [2] | The Prosecutor | 6-4 |
| [4] | Limitations on Defense Counsel | 6-7 |

### § 6.02 Federal Law of Environmental Crimes

| [1] | Introduction | 6-9 |
| [a] | The Clean Air Act | 6-10 |
| [i] | Development of the Statute | 6-10 |
| [ii] | Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 | 6-12 |
| [b] | The Clean Water Act | 6-16 |
| [i] | Development of the Statute | 6-16 |
| [ii] | Clean Water Act of 1987 | 6-17 |
| [c] | The Resource Conservation and Recovery Act | 6-23 |
| [i] | Illegal Transportation and Disposal of Hazardous Waste | 6-23 |
| [ii] | Material Omissions and Falsification of RCRA Records | 6-24 |
| [iii] | Destruction or Alteration of RCRA Records Relating to Non-Listed Wastes | 6-24 |
| [iv] | Knowing Endangerment | 6-27 |
| [v] | The “Mixture Rule” and the “Derived-From Rule” | 6-30.2 |
| [d] | Regulation of Chemicals | 6-32 |
| [i] | The Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act | 6-32 |
| [ii] | The Toxic Substances Control Act | 6-35 |
| [e] | Superfund | 6-36.1 |
| [f] | Reporting Violations | 6-37 |

### § 6.03 The Element of Mens Rea

| [1] | Introduction | 6-42 |
xvi

ENVIROMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

[4] Exceptions to Mens Rea; the Misdemeanor ... 6-66
   [a] Public Welfare Statutes ..................... 6-66
   [b] Responsible Corporate Officers .......... 6-68
   [c] Willful Blindness .......................... 6-73
[6] Corporate Liability for Individual Actions .. 6-75
[7] State Approaches to Mens Rea ............... 6-76.1

§ 6.04 State Enforcement of Environmental
Criminal Statutes ............................... 6-76.3

CHAPTER 7

Criminal Representation and Defense
in Environmental Law

§ 7.01 The Defense of Alleged Environmental Crimes .... 7-2
   [1] Reasons for the Institution of
       Criminal Proceedings ...................... 7-2
   [2] Guidelines for the Initiation of
       Criminal Proceedings ...................... 7-3
   [4] The Use of Scientific Data ............... 7-6
   [5] Competing Tensions ....................... 7-10
   [6] Structuring the Approach to the
       Prosecutor .............................. 7-12

§ 7.02 Representation of the Corporate Client .......... 7-17
   [1] General Considerations .................... 7-17
   [2] Violations Committed During the
       Corporate Response ...................... 7-17
   [3] Interview of Employees ................... 7-25
   [4] Search and Seizure—Criminal
       Investigation at the Gate ............... 7-26
   [7] Relationship with the Corporation’s
       Employees .............................. 7-33
       [a] Nontarget Employees ................. 7-33
       [b] Targeted Employees .................. 7-34
   [8] Department of Justice Guidelines on
       Prosecuting Corporations ............... 7-37

§ 7.03 Disposition of the Criminal Case ............... 7-42.3
   [1] Disposition and Global Considerations ...... 7-42.3
       [a] The Question: To Plead or
           Not to Plead .......................... 7-42.3
       [b] The Federal Sentencing Guidelines .... 7-42.3
       [c] Global Settlements ................... 7-46
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[d] Parallel Civil and Criminal
   Enforcement Proceedings .......... 7-47
[2] Need for Confidentiality ............ 7-54
[4] Structuring the Settlement of a
   Criminal Case ................. 7-55
[5] Subsequent Civil Proceedings ........ 7-55
   [a] Suspension and Debarment .... 7-56
   [i] Statutory Provisions ........ 7-56
   [ii] The Regulatory Framework ... 7-58
   [b] SEC Disclosure ................ 7-58.1
   [c] Bad Actor Disqualifications ... 7-62
§ 7.04 Significance of Criminal Prosecution .......... 7-65

CHAPTER 8

The Whys, Whens and Hows of
Environmental Self-Auditing

§ 8.01 Introduction .......................... 8-3
§ 8.02 What Is an Environmental Audit? ............. 8-7
   [1] Introduction .......................... 8-7
   [2] Sources for Guidance on Self-Policing
      and Auditing ...................... 8-8
   [3] Substantive Goals of an Environmental
      Compliance Audit .................. 8-9
§ 8.03 The Benefits of Effective Environmental Auditing . 8-10
   [1] Introduction .......................... 8-10
   [2] The Imposition of Significant
      Civil Penalties ..................... 8-10
      Auditing ........................... 8-11
      [a] Tort Liability ..................... 8-13
      [b] Criminal Liability ............... 8-13
   [5] Mitigation of Penalties as a Result of an
      Existing Audit Program .......... 8-13
      [a] EPA Policy ........................ 8-14
         [i] History of the EPA
            Auditing Policies ........... 8-14
         [ii] The EPA’s 2000 Audit Policy ... 8-15
      [b] Department of Justice Policy .... 8-22
      [c] The Federal Sentencing Guidelines ... 8-22
      [d] Self-Auditing Benefits Under
          Existing Federal Statute ........ 8-23
      [e] Self-Auditing Benefits Under
          Existing Federal Statute ........ 8-24

(Rel. 46)
[f] State Self-Auditing Privilege and
   Immunity Legislation............ 8-25
[i] Typical Audit Privilege
   Legislation ................. 8-25
[ii] Typical Audit Immunity
   Legislation ............... 8-26

[6] Benefits Listed by the General
   Accounting Office .......... 8-27

§ 8.04 How to Conduct an Effective Environmental
   Audit ........................................ 8-28
[2] Principles of Effective Environmental
   Auditing ................................. 8-28
   [a] Independent Auditors .......... 8-29
   [b] The Use of Counsel .............. 8-30
   [a] Overview of Concerns .......... 8-32
   [b] The Audit Process ............. 8-33
   [c] Management Commitment: Designing
       the Scope of the Audit and the
       Use of Checklists ................. 8-33
   [d] Review of Available
       Institutional Records .......... 8-34
   [e] The Auditor's Areas of Concern .... 8-35
   [f] Prior Directives, Orders and
       Consent Decrees ................. 8-36
   [g] Discharge of Waste Water ....... 8-36
   [h] Air Emissions .................. 8-37
   [i] Treatment, Storage and the
       Disposal of Hazardous Wastes ... 8-37
   [j] Above and Below Ground
       Storage Tanks ................... 8-39
   [k] Toxic Substances ............... 8-39
   [l] Superfund ....................... 8-39
   [m] Reporting Requirements ......... 8-39

[5] Making Sure the Documents Are Accurate ... 8-40
[6] Employee Interviews: Getting the Facts ... 8-41
[7] The Facility Inspection ............... 8-41
[8] Verification of Data .................. 8-43
[9] Writing the Environmental Audit Report .. 8-45
[10] Review Reconciliation and Implementation .. 8-46

§ 8.05 Minimizing the Risks Associated with
   Environmental Auditing ............ 8-47
[1] The Risks ......................... 8-47
[2] Maintaining, to the Greatest Extent Possible,
    the Confidentiality of the Audit .... 8-47
CHAPTER 9

Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Water Act

§ 9.01 Introduction ................................................. 9-3
§ 9.02 Antecedents ................................................ 9-4
§ 9.03 The Clean Water Act Amendments of 1972 ........... 9-6
§ 9.04 The Permit System ........................................ 9-8
[1] Navigable Waters ........................................... 9-11
[2] Point Sources ................................................. 9-15
§ 9.05 The Pretreatment Regulatory Program .......................................................... 9-25
[1] Introduction ........................................................................................................... 9-25
[2] Prohibited Discharges ......................................................................................... 9-26
[4] Other Controls ..................................................................................................... 9-28

§ 9.06 Nonpoint Source Control ................................................................................. 9-30
[1] Stormwater Pollution ............................................................................................ 9-31
   [a] Stormwater from Industrial Activities ............................................................... 9-32
   [b] Municipal Separate Sewer Systems .................................................................. 9-33
   [c] Stormwater from Construction Activities ....................................................... 9-34

§ 9.07 Wetlands ........................................................................................................... 9-37
[1] Introduction ........................................................................................................... 9-37
[5] Settlement ............................................................................................................. 9-44
[7] Criminal Enforcement ......................................................................................... 9-44

§ 9.08 Oil Spills ............................................................................................................ 9-46

§ 9.09 Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Water Act ................................................. 9-49
[1] Varied Enforcement ............................................................................................... 9-49
[5] Court Injunctions ................................................................................................ 9-53

§ 9.10 Defenses ............................................................................................................ 9-57
[1] Introduction ........................................................................................................... 9-57
[2] Initial Considerations ............................................................................................ 9-57
   [a] Permit Writing .................................................................................................. 9-57
   [i] Mixing Zones ................................................................................................... 9-60
   [ii] Biologically Available Metals ...................................................................... 9-61
   [iii] Minimum Levels of Quantification for Discharge Permit Limits ..................... 9-62
CHAPTER 10

Civil Enforcement Under the Clean Air Act

§ 10.01 Introduction ................................. 10-1
§ 10.02 The Clean Air Act’s Alphabet Soup:
   NAAQS, NESHAPs and SIPs .................... 10-3
   [1] NAAQS ........................................ 10-3
   [3] SIPs ........................................ 10-7
§ 10.03 The Clean Air Act’s Title V Permit Program .... 10-9
   [1] Permits and Parameters .................... 10-13
§ 10.04 Information Gathering ..................... 10-17

(Rel. 46)
CHAPTER 11

Civil Enforcement Under the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act

§ 11.01 Introduction ........................................... 11-2
§ 11.02 The Management of Hazardous Waste ............... 11-4
  [1] Solid Waste ............................................ 11-4
  [a] Generators’ Manifest Requirements .... 11-19
  [b] Generators’ Pre-Transport Requirements .......... 11-21
  [c] Generators’ Recordkeeping and Reporting ................. 11-22
  [d] Exports by Generators ......................... 11-23
[9] TSD Owners or Operators ...................... 11-25
  [a] On-Site Generators Storing Wastes Less Than Ninety Days .... 11-25
  [b] All Other Owners and Operators .............. 11-26
[10] Corrective Action .............................. 11-27
  [a] Applicability ................................. 11-28
  [b] Regulatory Requirements for Corrective Action .............. 11-29
  [c] Corrective Action Management Units .......... 11-29
  [d] Temporary Units ......................... 11-30
  [f] Corrective Action and Contribution .... 11-31
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.03</td>
<td>Regulation of Underground Storage Tanks</td>
<td>11-33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.04</td>
<td>Permits</td>
<td>11-37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.05</td>
<td>Federal Enforcement</td>
<td>11-39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Compliance Orders, Administrative Penalties and Injunctive Relief</td>
<td>11-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Civil Penalties</td>
<td>11-43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Gravity</td>
<td>11-43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Economic Benefit of Noncompliance</td>
<td>11-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Adjustment Factors</td>
<td>11-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>Good Faith Efforts to Comply</td>
<td>11-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii]</td>
<td>Degree of Willfulness and/or Negligence</td>
<td>11-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iii]</td>
<td>History of Noncompliance</td>
<td>11-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iv]</td>
<td>Ability to Pay</td>
<td>11-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[v]</td>
<td>Other Unique Factors</td>
<td>11-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Interim Status Corrective Action</td>
<td>11-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.06</td>
<td>State Reinforcement</td>
<td>11-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>The RCRA Grant Program</td>
<td>11-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.07</td>
<td>Defenses</td>
<td>11-55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Statutory Defenses</td>
<td>11-57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Regulatory Exclusions</td>
<td>11-63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[5]</td>
<td>Other Defenses</td>
<td>11-64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Recycling</td>
<td>11-64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Safe Storage</td>
<td>11-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Compliance with Other Statutes</td>
<td>11-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d]</td>
<td>The Household Waste Exclusion</td>
<td>11-66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.08</td>
<td>Citizen Suits</td>
<td>11-67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 12

Structure of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 12.01</td>
<td>Overview of CERCLA</td>
<td>12-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>12-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Basic Structure of CERCLA</td>
<td>12-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Five Basic Components</td>
<td>12-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Liability: Strict, Retroactive, and Perhaps Joint and Several</td>
<td>12-11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Rel. 46)
ENVIROMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

[i] Strict Liability .................. 12-12
[ii] Retroactive Liability .......... 12-14
[iii] Joint and Several Liability
   Under CERCLA ................. 12-15

§ 12.02 The National Priorities List ................. 12-20
[1] Introduction .......................... 12-20
   [a] The State Role in Site Selection .... 12-22
   [b] The Hazard Ranking System ....... 12-23
   [c] Listing Because of Health Threats ... 12-24
   [d] Delisting After Cleanup .......... 12-24

§ 12.03 The National Contingency Plan ............. 12-26
§ 12.04 The Heart of CERCLA—Section 107 Liability ..... 12-30
[1] Parties Liable .......................... 12-30
   [a] Current Owners and Operators .... 12-31
   [i] Lessors and Lessees ............ 12-36
   [ii] Banks and Financing
       Institutions .......................... 12-38
   [iii] Past Owners .................... 12-41
   [b] Liability of Arrangers or
       Generators .......................... 12-44
   [c] Liability of Transporters ......... 12-48
   [d] Statutory and Common Law
       Approaches to Finding Additional
       Solvent Parties .................... 12-49
   [i] Parent and Subsidiary
       Corporations ..................... 12-50
   [ii] “Direct” CERCLA Statutory
       Liability .......................... 12-52
   [iii] “Indirect” CERCLA Liability
       Through Developing
       Common Law ..................... 12-58
   [e] The Traditional Exceptions ....... 12-60.4
   [f] Continuity of Enterprise/Substantial
       Continuation ..................... 12-60.5

§ 12.05 Defenses .................................... 12-60.7
[1] Standard Statutory Defenses ........ 12-60.7
   [a] Act of God .......................... 12-60.7
   [b] Act of War .......................... 12-60.8
   [c] Third Party Defense ............. 12-60.8
[2] Other Statutory Defenses .......... 12-60.10
   [a] The Innocent Purchaser Defense ... 12-60.10
   [b] Secured Creditor Defense ....... 12-60.12
   [c] The Consumer Product Exception ... 12-60.13
   [d] The Scope of “Release” to the
       “Environment” .................... 12-60.15
   [e] The Petroleum Exclusion ......... 12-60.16
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[f]</td>
<td>The Pesticide Exclusion</td>
<td>12-60.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[g]</td>
<td>Federally Permitted Release</td>
<td>12-60.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[h]</td>
<td>Naturally Occurring Substances</td>
<td>12-60.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>Statute of Limitations</td>
<td>12-60.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[j]</td>
<td>Recycling</td>
<td>12-60.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Liability Defenses for “De Micromis” Waste and Municipal Solid Waste</td>
<td>12-60.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Ability to Pay</td>
<td>12-60.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Contiguous Property Defense</td>
<td>12-60.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d]</td>
<td><em>Bona Fide</em> Prospective Purchaser</td>
<td>12-60.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[e]</td>
<td>Amendments to the Innocent Landowner Defense</td>
<td>12-60.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f]</td>
<td>Limits on Federal Response Actions at Sites Subject to Response Actions Pursuant to State Law</td>
<td>12-60.32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### § 12.06 Costs of Response

- [1] Limited Damages | 12-61 |
- [2] Removal and Remediation Costs | 12-64 |
- [3] Oversight and Indirect Costs | 12-64.1 |
- [4] Interest | 12-66 |

#### § 12.07 Cleanup Standards for Response Actions

- [1] Introduction | 12-67 |
  - [a] Preference for Permanent Remedies and On-Site Treatment | 12-68 |
  - [b] Considerations for Alternative Remedies | 12-68 |
- [3] Degree of Cleanup | 12-70 |
- [4] Standards for On-Site Cleanups | 12-73 |
- [5] Standards Applicable to Off-Site Transfers | 12-75 |

#### § 12.08 Natural Resource Damages

- [1] Introduction: The Statutory and Regulatory Scheme | 12-76 |
  - [a] Statutory Basis | 12-76 |
  - [b] Regulatory Implementation |
    - [i] Designation of the Trustee | 12-81 |
    - [ii] Assessment of Damages | 12-81 |
  - [c] What Constitutes a Natural Resource? | 12-82 |
- [2] Natural Resource Damage Defenses | 12-84 |
  - [a] Limitation on Costs | 12-84 |
  - [b] Date of Injury to Natural Resource | 12-84 |
  - [c] Statute of Limitations | 12-86 |
CHAPTER 13

Enforcement and Initiatives Under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act

§ 13.01 Government Enforcement ........................................... 13-3
[1] Overview of EPA Enforcement
   Approaches .................................................. 13-3
[3] Unilateral Remediation Orders Under
   Section 106 ................................................. 13-6
   [a] Introduction ............................................. 13-6
   [b] The Statutory Scheme .................................. 13-7
   [c] Government Enforcement Policy
      Under Section 106 ........................................ 13-9
      [i] Introduction .......................................... 13-9
      [ii] What the EPA Looks for Before
           Issuing a Section 106
                Order ........................................... 13-13
   [d] “Sufficient Cause” ....................................... 13-14
   [e] The Consequence of Section 106
       Noncompliance .......................................... 13-18
   [f] Claims for Reimbursement
       from the Fund .......................................... 13-20
   [a] Procedural Obstacles to Judicial
       Review .................................................. 13-21
   [b] Deferential Standard of Review ................. 13-22
   [c] Challenges on Technical Grounds .............. 13-23
   [a] The Government’s Advantage ................. 13-24
   [b] Leveling the Legal Playing
       Field—Divisibility of Harm ...................... 13-25
   [c] Unreasonable Response Costs ............... 13-32
   [d] Oversight Costs ........................................ 13-33
   [e] Retreat from Judicial Deference ............ 13-33
   [a] Orphan Shares .......................................... 13-34.1
   [b] Partial NPL De-Listing ............................. 13-34.1
   [c] Allocation Pilot Projects ......................... 13-34.2

§ 13.02 Litigation Strategies .............................................. 13-34.3
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 13.03</th>
<th>Negotiated Settlements and Consent Decrees Under CERCLA</th>
<th>13-36</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>13-36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Statutory Incentives to Settle</td>
<td>13-37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>Covenant Not to Sue</td>
<td>13-38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii]</td>
<td>Contribution Protection</td>
<td>13-39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iii]</td>
<td>Other Actions</td>
<td>13-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iv]</td>
<td>Nonsettlor Rights</td>
<td>13-41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Lodging and Public Comment</td>
<td>13-41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Intervention Issues</td>
<td>13-41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>Timeliness</td>
<td>13-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ii]</td>
<td>Protectable Interest</td>
<td>13-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d]</td>
<td>Effects of Settlement Agreement</td>
<td>13-43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>13-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Provisions of the Model Consent Decree</td>
<td>13-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Changes Effected by the Revised Model Consent Decree</td>
<td>13-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d]</td>
<td>Section 113(f)(3)(b) Contribution Claim Changes</td>
<td>13-47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Contribution Protection and Opposition from Other Defendants</td>
<td>13-52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[i]</td>
<td>“Equitable Share” or “Amount of Settlement”?</td>
<td>13-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Settlement Litigation by Nonsettlers</td>
<td>13-54.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 13.04</th>
<th>Private Claims for Relief Under CERCLA</th>
<th>13-56</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Express Claim for Relief</td>
<td>13-56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Distinction Between Claims</td>
<td>13-57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Pre-Aviall Caselaw</td>
<td>13-59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Aviall and Post-Aviall Cases</td>
<td>13-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[d]</td>
<td>Right of Contribution</td>
<td>13-69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[e]</td>
<td>Orphan Shares</td>
<td>13-71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[f]</td>
<td>Allocation Standards</td>
<td>13-76.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[g]</td>
<td>PRP Allocation</td>
<td>13-85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Consistency with the National Contingency Plan</td>
<td>13-87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Case Law</td>
<td>13-87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Substantial or Strict Compliance with the NCP</td>
<td>13-91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

[a] Pleadings .......................... 13-93
[b] Third and Multiparty Practice .... 13-94
[c] Bifurcation ......................... 13-96
[d] Marshalling the Evidence ......... 13-97

Section 107 ............................ 13-98


[a] Supreme Court Resolution of
Conflicting Decisions Against
General Recovery .................... 13-104

[b] Distinctions Among Grants of
Attorneys’ Fees in Citizen Suits
Under Sections 107, 113, and 310
of CERCLA ......................... 13-106

§ 13.05 Moving Toward the Future: Common Sense and
Brownfields Initiatives ............... 13-107

CHAPTER 14

Civil Enforcement Under the Emergency Planning
and Community Right-to-Know Act (EPCRA)

§ 14.01 Overview .......................... 14-2

§ 14.02 Statutory and Regulatory Framework .......... 14-5


[a] Emergency Notification ............ 14-5

[b] Material Safety Data Sheet ........ 14-8

[c] Emergency and Hazardous Chemical
Inventory Forms ..................... 14-9

[d] Toxic Chemical Release Forms
(Form R) ............................. 14-11

[e] Other Information Requirements .... 14-15

[f] Public Access to Chemical Safety
Information .......................... 14-16


[a] Statutory Penalties for EPCRA
Violations ............................ 14-17

[i] Reporting Violations .............. 14-17

[ii] Trade Secret Claim
Violations ............................ 14-20

[b] Who Enforces EPCRA ............... 14-20.1

§ 14.03 Defenses .......................... 14-20.2

[1] Defenses to Liability .......... 14-20.2

[2] Defenses in Citizen Suits
Under EPCRA ....................... 14-31

§ 14.04 EPCRA Civil Penalty Policies ............. 14-34
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1. The Form R Penalty Policy
   - The Basic Form R Penalty
   - Adjustments Factors
     - Culpability
     - Voluntary Disclosure
     - History of Prior Violations
     - Delisted Chemicals
     - Attitude
     - “Other Factors as Justice May Require”
     - Settlement with Conditions
     - Ability to Pay

2. Penalty Policy for Other EPCRA Requirements
   - Introduction
   - Calculating the Base Penalty
     - The “Nature” of the Violation
     - The “Extent” of the Violation
     - The “Gravity” of the Violation
     - “Circumstances” and the Base Penalty Matrice
   - Assessment of Multi-Day Penalties
   - Individual Adjustment Factors
     - Ability to Pay
     - Prior History of Violations
     - Degree of Culpability
     - Economic Benefit or Savings
     - Other Matters as Justice May Require
     - Business Size
     - Attitude
     - Supplemental Environmental Projects
     - Voluntary Disclosure

§ 14.05 Applying the EPCRA Penalty Policies

**CHAPTER 15**

Citizen Suits, and the Award of Attorneys’ Fees in Environmental Litigation

§ 15.01 Overview

§ 15.02 Citizen Suits

[1] Legislative Intent


(Rel. 46)
ENVIRONMENTAL ENFORCEMENT

[a] The Clean Water Act................. 15-9
[b] The Clean Air Act ................ 15-12
[c] The Resource Conservation and
   Recovery Act ...................... 15-17
[d] Emergency Planning and Community
   Right-to-Know Act ............... 15-26
[e] Toxic Substances Control Act ...... 15-28
[f] Comprehensive Environmental
   Response, Compensation
   and Liability Act ............... 15-29

[3] Preservation of Existing Remedies
   (Savings Clauses) .................. 15-31

[7] Private Intervention in Government
   Litigation ........................ 15-34

§ 15.03 Litigation Strategies .................. 15-36

[1] Suits Against the Administrator .... 15-36
   [a] Selection of Targets ........... 15-40
   [b] Thorough Investigation ......... 15-40
   [c] Maximize Number of Counts ..... 15-40
   [d] Timing of Litigation ............ 15-40
   [e] Relationship with Regulatory
       Agency ........................ 15-41
   [f] Standing ........................ 15-41
   [g] Pleading the Violation .......... 15-41
   [h] Increased Risk of Injury ........ 15-41
   [i] Aggressive Conduct .......... 15-42
   [j] Getting to Judgment ............ 15-43

   [a] General Considerations .......... 15-43
   [b] Control of Reactions .......... 15-43
   [c] Dealing in Candor ............ 15-43
   [d] Using the Sixty- or Ninety-Day
       Window ........................ 15-43
   [e] Fighting the Allegations of
       Wrongdoing ..................... 15-44
   [f] Technical Defenses ............ 15-45
      [i] Lack of Standing ............. 15-45
      [ii] Lack of Notice .............. 15-55
      [iii] When Suit May Be Brought
            Immediately Upon Notice .. 15-57
   [iv] Statute of Limitations ......... 15-59
   [v] Wholly Past Violations ........ 15-60
   [vi] Mootness ..................... 15-66.1
TABLE OF CONTENTS

[viii] Prior Resolution .................. 15-68
[ix] Upset Defense to Clean Water Act Prosecutions .................. 15-68
[g] Judicial Involvement .................. 15-69
[h] Impleading the Environmental Agency .................. 15-69
[i] Keeping an Eye on the Ball ........ 15-70
[5] Settlement and Relief .................. 15-70
[a] Negotiated Settlement .................. 15-70
[b] Litigated Relief .................. 15-70
[c] Relief Requested .................. 15-70

§ 15.04 The Award of Attorneys’ Fees .................. 15-72
[1] Introduction .................. 15-72
[2] Non-Statutory Exception for Award of Attorneys’ Fees .................. 15-72
[5] Party Eligible for Award .................. 15-75
[8] Award of Fees for Preparation of Fee Application .................. 15-84

§ 15.05 Conclusion .................. 15-87

INDEX .................. I-1

(Rel. 46)